

Report to Scrutiny Panel

Name of Scrutiny Panel	Economy & Environment
Meeting Date	17 th December 2015
Subject	Local Environment and Public Health – update report
Wards Affected	ALL
Report of	Joint Report of Director – Economy & Environment and Director – Public Health
Type of Item	Review existing policy
(please tick ✓)	Development of new policy
	Performance management (inc. financial)
	Briefing (inc. potential areas for scrutiny)
	Statutory consultation
	Council request
	Cabinet request
	Member request for scrutiny (CCFA)

Why is it coming here?

As per request of panel members

What are the key points?

Work is ongoing, but progressing well

Possible courses of action

To continue to monitor work moving forward

Contact Officer

Heidi Wilson, Housing Access & Waste Manager, heidi.wilson@calderdale.gov.uk, 01422 392406

Should this report be exempt?

No

Report to Scrutiny Panel

1. Background

A report was considered at panel on 2nd April 2015 which contained the findings and recommendations of the Local Environment and Public Health in Calderdale Scrutiny Review.

A Review Group had been appointed by the Panel in the autumn of 2014 to do a detailed scrutiny review on the relationships between the local environment and public health in Calderdale. Appended to the report was the Local Environment and Public Health detailed scrutiny review, which sought the Panel's endorsement and approval.

A further report was taken to Cabinet on 15th June 2015 to consider the findings and recommendations of the Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel report – Local Environment and Public Health in Calderdale.

This report provides an update on the key recommendations that were identified.

2. Main issues for Scrutiny

The review identified 9 key recommendations, which are outlined in Appendix 1. The appendix provides details of each recommendation, who the lead officer is and the progress to date.

It should be noted that most recommendations are cross-cutting and therefore have input from a number of internal and external partners. The comments provided reflect this.

3. Consultation

All key services have been consulted as part of this update. Each recommendation outlines the further consultation that has taken place with internal and external partners. A number of areas of work has involved consultation with a wider audience, such as residents of the Borough.

4. Further action and timescales

A number of areas of work will need to continue to progress. Where appropriate each recommendation provides guidance on timescales and further action required.

5. Options appraisal

Where appropriate each recommendation provides guidance on options considered.

6. Conclusions

A great deal of work has been completed since April 2015. However, further progress is required in a number of areas to achieve the outcomes identified by Scrutiny panel.

7. Appendices

- 1. Local Environment and Public Health update table
- 2. Slow Tour of Yorkshire guide
- 3. a) Safe Cycling Route East
 - b) Safe Cycling Route West
- 4. Health and Wellbeing Board Air Quality report
- 5. Calderdale Response to Government Consultation on Air Quality
- 6. a) Affordable Warmth Cabinet Report
 - b) Affordable Warmth Cabinet Report Appendix 1 (Project Outcomes)

8. Background documents

None

9. Documents available for inspection at:

Northgate House, Northgate, Halifax, HX1 1UN

Recommendation	Responsible Officer	Comments/update
Recommendation 1: The Director, Communities and Service Support and the Director of Public Health, are requested to prepare a leaflet containing details, lengths etc. mapping National Cycle Route 66, perhaps dividing it into manageable lengths, and showing access points, so that local people and tourists are made aware of what Calderdale was offering in its endeavour to support cycling. This would be a good way forward to support healthy living, outdoor pursuits, and safe cycling and it is essential that the information is passed to the public via Tourist Information Centres, libraries and websites, etc.	Paul Butcher	 A number of "Slow Tour maps of Calderdale" have been developed (see Appendix 2 for an example) Public health has been working with Sustrans to develop materials to promoting accessible safe cycling routes. Two route guides have been produced for NCN 66 under the 'Inner Cyclist' branding for the western and eastern sections through Calderdale. As well as showing links to the wider cycle and highway network they feature local attractions at the towns and villages along the route. The guides are available as hard copy and on the web at: http://www.cyclecalderdale.co.uk/files/docs/Calderdale_West_route_guide_for_web.pdf http://www.cyclecalderdale.co.uk/files/docs/Calderdale_East_route_guide_for_web.pdf Or, see Appendix 3a & 3b for copies of both. These will be promoted across the borough via relevant methods and venues. Calderdale has been a part of IBM global health corps programme. the findings are due to be published December 14th this initiative is the first of its kind in the world is focussed upon increasing levels of activity, the cycling work will form a part of the councils work on creating a better living movement

Recommendation	Responsible Officer	Comments/update
Recommendation 2: To help promote active and sustainable travel across the Borough, Cabinet be asked to consider setting aside a proportion of the annual highways budget specifically for cycle path improvements.	John Lamb/Peter Stubbs	 The cycle network comprises a combination of different types of route each carrying a different status and different maintenance obligations: On highway cycle lanes; Promoted 'quiet lanes'; Segregated route adjacent to highway e.g. Elland Wood Bottom; Bridleway; Permissive cycle routes by agreement with the landowner e.g. Brearley Wood; Canal towpath; Designated cycleway e.g. Tipside, Todmorden Designated routes with no highway status e.g. Hebble Trail Excluding the highway network the total length of cycle routes where maintenance liability rests with the Council is 152 miles of which 144 miles is bridleway and byway, 5.3 miles is towpath, 1 mile is permissive cycle route and approximately 1 mile carries no status. Maintenance liability for additional significant lengths and structures, including towpath and West Vale Viaduct, rest with Canals and River Trust and Sustrans. The Council's highways maintenance budgets currently stand at (2015/16 figures) £3.9 million maintenance capital budget and £6.2 million maintenance and other revenue works budgets (this includes £1.6 million energy costs). Highways maintenance budgets do not specifically identify an allocation for 'cycle routes'. On highway facilities are covered by the general highway maintenance programmes. There is also a revenue budget allocation of £53,350 (2015/16 budget) for public rights of way (PROW - including bridleways and byways). The PROW allocation is topped up with a

further £10,000 capital money from the Local Transport Plan, subject to annual review. The Council does not have a defined maintenance regime for other cycle routes, but we do work in partnership with Canals and River Trust and Sustrans to monitor and remedy maintenance issues where appropriate. The approach taken has been very much led by
the funding opportunities available to the Council and also the types and surface treatments of the routes being developed and is one of significant capital investment to introduce new routes followed by a period of 'managed decline' ensuring that the routes remain safe to use. Opportunities are then sought for further capital funding to reconstruct routes once they become life-expired.
 The Council has been successful in securing significant amounts of capital funding for cycle routes in recent years as follows: 2013/14 £375,000 including reconstruction of NCN route 66 and development of Elland Wood Bottom Cycleway and Salterhebble underpass; 2014/15 £283,000 including reconstruction of NCN route 66 and West Vale Viaduct route ; 2015/16 – 2017/18 up to £3.2 million for City Connect 2 route development and construction between Todmorden and Cooper Bridge.
Through the Cycling Strategy currently being developed by the Council it is recommended that a cycle network development plan is produced to identify future schemes that could be prepared in anticipation of future funding opportunities.

Recommendation	Responsible Officer	Comments/update
Recommendation 3: Cabinet be asked to give consideration to the establishment of one or two data analyst positions to work on a cross-Council basis.	Cabinet	 This action has not progressed at this time due to wider financial pressures facing the Council
Recommendation 4: The Cabinet Member and the Director, Economy and Environment be requested to take note of and consider the evidential research previously undertaken by the National Institute of Environmental Health and the Building Research Establishment which suggests that targeting the Borough's worst housing with a £1.4m investment programme could save an estimated £4.65m in associated health care costs (and the increase in economic benefits such work would bring to the Borough).	Helen Rhodes	 The Building Research Establishment (BRE) have carried out a modelled stock condition survey and health impact assessment of the whole Borough, this will greatly assist the targeting of the £1.4M. A short presentation to scrutiny members will provided on this issue

Recommendation	Responsible Officer	Comments/update
Recommendation 5: Cabinet's agreement and support be sought for the early revision of the Calderdale Air Quality Action Plan, which was written in 2009 and is in need of updating.	Peter Broadbent	 Updating of the Council's Air Quality Action Plan has been delayed pending the development and adoption of the West Yorkshire Low Emission Strategy EFRA have announced a final consultation on the proposed changes to Local Air Quality Management Arrangements. The statutory guidance is binding on local authorities in fulfilling their duties under the Environment Act 2005. The Guidance is very much moving the focus to action to improve air quality and emphasises the need for cross-departmental and interauthority support to deliver these actions – explicitly mentioning Transport, Planning, Highways Authorities, Public Health as well as Environmental Health and that a Steering Group should be set up to develop and oversee the implementation of Strategy and Action Plans. More information is attached. ADPH would like to encourage members to respond to this consultation. The deadline for responding is Thursday 21st January 2016.

Recommendation	Responsible Officer	Comments/update	
Recommendation 6: Cabinet's agreement and support be sought to the undertaking and promotion of a targeted campaign of awareness of the on- going West Yorkshire Low Emissions Strategy work from a public health perspective, with the primary delivery method to be through low cost platforms such as social media (Facebook, Twitter etc.)	Paul Butcher	 Across West Yorkshire there has been consultation on the proposed West Yorkshire low emission strategy. To support this work the Department of Public Health (DPH) has undertaken a number of media assignments including interviews with local radio as well as local press releases. Reports on impact of air quality have been tabled at the Health and Well-Being Board with all partners requested to consider actions their organisations can undertake to improve air quality in Calderdale. See Appendix 4 A co-ordinated West Yorkshire campaign across is an item to be considered once the results of the consultation have been analysed and considered by respective authorities. The draft West Yorkshire Low Emission Strategy was open to public consultation between 2nd November and 11th December 2015 including on the Council website at;: 	
Recommendation 7: Cabinet is asked to endorse and support more direct enforcement work being undertaken by external partners of the Council, such as the Police, through the use of legally enforceable powers to tackle un- roadworthy vehicles with high emissions.	Ryan Carroll	 The most sensible approach to enforcement against unroadworthy vehicles would be a targeted campaign of roadside testing. This requires a discussion between Council, West Yorkshire Police and the Driver and Vehicle Standards Agency and may require additional funding to implement Work is also taking place within the Council to address high emissions. Economy & Environment Directorate are using some Electric Vehicles (for example, the handyman vans) and in the Environmental Health Enforcement Team a trial is being run to look at minimising mileage travelled 	

Recommendation	Responsible Officer	Comments/update
Recommendation 8: Cabinet is asked to look into the possibility of undertaking a feasibility study into the possibility of introducing designated Low Emission Zones in Calderdale.	Paul Butcher	 Given the transport flow across West Yorkshire and the responsibility of the combined authority for transport related issues Calderdale has been an active member in the development of the low emission zone strategy. <u>http://www.calderdale.gov.uk/council/consultations/engage/view.jsp?id=13368</u> Once the results of the consultation of the West Yorkshire strategy are considered cabinet will consider whether a feasibility study for our area will add further value given cost that this will entail. Furthermore the council has responded to the recent air quality consultation from central government. See Appendix 5
Recommendation 9:Cabinet be informed that it should request a policy paper as soon as possible on how the £1.4m affordable warmth scheme recently agreed by Council providing grants to improve heating and insulation was to be implemented, and it is recommended that that the Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel could be used as "a sounding board" on this important piece of policy development work. Links to public health, hospital trust and Adults Health and Social Care, the Better Care Fund and the work of the Health and Wellbeing Board would also need to be considered in taking this work forward.Cabinet was requested to consider the findings recommendations of the Scrutiny Review and to provide responses at the earliest opportunity.	Helen Rhodes	 A report will be considered at Cabinet on the 14th December (see Appendix 6a & 6b). This sets out a programme of works to be delivered over the next three years and beyond. The Council's Home Energy Action Team would take a central role in co-ordinating, signposting and monitoring as well as some of the project delivery. The results of the BRE research will assist with how best to prioritise and target the most vulnerable groups and how to achieve the best results in terms of improved health. Scrutiny panel is requested to maintain an on-going role in monitoring the progress and direction of the programme



HEBDEN BRIDGE TO BRIGHOUSE

Hebden Bridge to Brighouse 25 mile return journey (12.5 miles each way). Approximately 3-4 hours.

This scenic ride takes you from the bustling town of Hebden Bridge, using the towpaths of the Rochdale Canal and the Calder and Hebble Navigation, before joining quiet country lanes heading into the market town of Brighouse.

• Exit Hebden Bridge Station; turn right following the cycle path.

• Follow National Route 66 signs to Mytholmroyd, where Ted Hughes the poet laureate was born. Here you'll also find the infamous Cragg Vale, the longest continuous incline in England. Staying in the valley, head up the ramp signposted to Mytholmroyd station.

• Follow the towpath to the picturesque market town of Sowerby Bridge, where you travel on road before joining the towpath of the Calder and Hebble Navigation.

• Turn right at the Salterhebble canal junction past the lockkeeper's cottage and through the tunnel – don't forget to ring your bell! Continue on the towpath.

• Here, the route crosses to the other side of the canal. Follow the road around and over the bridge, turn left down Gas Works Lane, follow the path and turn left between the houses to go back onto the canal bank.

• Continue on the towpath, passing Cromwell Bottom Local Nature Reserve, to Brighouse where there are many cafés and shops.

• To return by train, follow the signs for the railway station. Alternatively you can retrace the route back to Hebden Bridge.





The Slow Tour is a guide to 21 of the best cycle routes across Yorkshire on the National Cycle Network.

The routes have something for everyone, whether you are a family, new to cycling or a regular cyclist. You can take public transport to the start of most routes and hire bikes there too.

Tourist attractions ● heritage sites cafés and pubs ● picnic spots ● canals museums ● playgrounds ● artwork

If you like this route, try out the other 20.

Download your free maps at WWW.SUSTRANS.ORG.UK/SLOWTOUROFYORKSHIRE



Hebden Bridge to Brighouse is part of Route 66 of the National Cycle Network







Hebden Bridge to Brighouse



STAGE 11



ENJOY A GREAT CYCLING DAY OUT... AT YOUR OWN PACE !



Registered charity number 326550 (England and Wales) SCO39263 (Scotland)

goscycling

Fine Really Bid Calderdale

Sowerby Bridge

The Rochdale Canal and Calder & Hebble Navigation meet at Sowerby Bridge and the Wharf area is the heart of the town's great food and drink offer, with the Moorings Pub & Kitchen, Temujin Mongolian stir fry and Gabriel's Coffee Lounge.

Visit Tuel Lane Lock, the deepest in the country, and the adjacent Sowerby Bridge Market.



The 253 foot high Wainhouse Tower at King Cross, which can be seen from the National Cycle Network 66, was originally commissioned as a chimney for the local dye works by John Edward Wainhouse in the late 19th century. The structure was never used as a working chimney and is regarded by many as one of Britain's finest follies. The Tower is open to the public on certain dates throughout the year for ascents to the top via an internal spiral staircase.











UIC

EAS

le



Family-run shops, cafes and restaurants and the weekly outdoor market gives Elland town centre a homely appeal. Elland is also home to The Rex Cinema, one of Britain's oldest surviving purpose-built picture houses and Joseph Dobson & Sons, the home of the Yorkshire Mixture, who have been making traditional confectionery for well over a century.



One Way NCN Route 66 Link Calder & Hebble



GALDERDALE

APPENDIX 3a

Near Halifax



The Green Flag awardwinning Manor Heath Park is well worth a visit. The park offers a children's play area, rope climbing wall, picnic area and wooded trail. You can take a tropical tour around the Jungle Experience to discover prehistoric and insect eating plants, butterflies, fish and waterfalls and the walled garden hides ten completely different smaller gardens.



Brighouse sits alongside the Calder and Hebble Navigation - part river, part canal. The town has a wealth of great annual events, such as the 1940's Weekend, Art Festival, Canal Festival and Victorian Christmas Festival, in addition to highly popular 'Totally Locally' street markets.

Brighouse is also home to Rokt Climbing Gym, the largest indoor climbing gym in Yorkshire! Prego's is a lovely family run restaurant for a welldeserved lunch or try the newly opened Millers Bar by the canal.





Salterhebble (the name means "the salt-sellers' foot-bridge") is located just outside Halifax, where Hebble Brook flows into the River Calder.

The Hebble Trail Cycleway leads from Salterhebble into Halifax, taking you past Shaw Lodge Mills, the Shears inn at 'Paris Gates' and the Shay Stadium to Eureka! the National Children's Museum, The Piece Hall, Bankfield Museum and Halifax Ski & Snowboard Centre.

With 13 sandstone arches and a curve at its northern end, West Vale Viaduct is an imposing sight. The Grade II listing viaduct is now open for walking and cycling part of the National Cycle Network.







Outdoor **Activities**

Just North of Brighouse town centre, Wellholme Park is well known for its spectacular floral bedding displays and has been awarded both the coveted 'Green Flag' status and the prestigious 'Queen Elizabeth II Fields' status.

Sit and relax in the surroundings, enjoy a picnic, explore the natural woodlands, go skateboarding, play tennis, crazy golf and crown green bowling. An exciting playground gives hours of enjoyment to our younger visitors.



Cromwell Bottom Nature Reserve is located next to the Navigation; one of Calderdale's richest areas of biodiversity, boasting over 130 species of plant, 200 species of birds, large numbers of mammals, amphibians and a plethora of invertebrate life.







goscycling

f Really Big

Todmorden

Todmorden is home to Stoodley Pike monument, and has some of the best mountain bike terrain in Yorkshire with miles of bridleway networks. Explore the independent shops & cafes, thriving markets and amazing architecture.

Just outside the town centre is Centre Vale Park, where you can enjoy crazy golf, tennis, bowling and events throughout the year. You'll also find The Lucky Dog, as made famous by Derren Brown in his channel 4 TV show 'The Experiments'.



The life sized statue, installed next to the Memorial Gardens, has gained a wide-spread reputation for bringing good luck to anybody that gives it a friendly pat.







NDDEST L

VES

e

Sowerby Bridge

The Rochdale Canal and Calder & Hebble Navigation meet at Sowerby Bridge and the Wharf area is the heart of the town's great food and drink offer, with the Moorings Pub & Kitchen, Temujin Mongolian stir fry and Gabriel's Coffee Lounge.

Visit Tuel Lane Lock, the deepest in the country, and the adjacent Sowerby Bridge Market.

Sowerby Bridge Wharf



great views.













Hebden Bridge, voted as the "fourth funkiest town in the world" and "the greatest town in Europe" is full of great independent shops, many of which showcase the work of local artists.

On the outskirts of the town, a favourite stop for cyclists is Stubbing Wharf Pub situated on the banks of the canal. In the town there are plenty of cafes to fuel up with coffee and cake, Coffee Cali is cycling friendly with lots of bike racks to the rear and there's even one smack in the middle of Calder



Blazing Saddles bike shop offers free bike lock hire too for that much needed pit stop.

- 4 Stubbing Wharf Pub
- **5** Coffee Cali
- 6 Calder Holmes Park
- **7** Blazing Saddles bike shop



Mytholmroyd

Lair of 18th century counterfeiting gang the 'Cragg Vale Coiners', birthplace of the late Poet Laureate Ted Hughes; Mytholmroyd is home to the World Dock Pudding Championships.

The steep and winding Cragg Road, the longest continuous incline in England, leads from Mytholmroyd, winding its way up to beautiful heather-clad moorland 1,000 feet above. The Dusty Miller pub by the side of the canal offers a warm welcome and good food.

Also on the canalside you can read one of the many interpretation boards that tell the amazing history of the canal. Close by is the sculpture of a crow, commemorating the work of poet Laureate Ted Hughes. Newly opened Craggies Café at Cragg Vale Business park offers a welcome cycle friendly pit stop for those attempting Cragg Vale.





Luddendenfoot

Luddendenfoot may only be small but there's more sculpture and interpretation boards by the canal-side Holmes Park, a couple of pubs and a restaurant. The village of Luddenden on the millstone grit flanks of the valley above has been a conservation area since 1973 and offers some

10 Jerusalem Farm Local Nature Reserve & camp site (11) Holmes Park

Walsden

Famed for the Summit Tunnel and the highest canal lock in the country, Walsden is home to the ever-popular Grandma Pollard's Chippy "frying tonight" for over 50 years! (Not open at the weekends) and the impressive Gordon Rigg Garden Centre, with everything from plants and greenery to crafts, home furnishings and a café.

- Grandma Pollards Chippy 2 Gordon Riggs

Cragg Vale Coiners

The tranquility of Mytholmroyd belies a murky past involving an 18th century counterfeiting gang, the 'Cragg Vale Coiners'. This gang's activities were said to be so damaging that they threatened to wreck Britain's currency.

'King' David Hartley and his men used ironworking as a cover to clip the edges from gold coins, milling the edges back so the change was unnoticeable, and making counterfeit coins from the shavings whilst returning the clipped coins into circulation.



Rumours of the gang's activities reached the authorities, who sent an excise man named William Deighton to investigate. Deighton was murdered and the subsequent reward offered for information led to the arrest of over 30 people, including 'King David' Hartley, who was sentenced to death and on April 28th 1770.





Calderdale MBC

Calderdale Health and Wellbeing Board

Date:	27th August	
Wards Affected:	All	
Subject:	Air quality and health	
Report of:	Director of Public Health	
Type of Item	Policy	
(please indicate X)	Performance Management	
	Governance	
	Board assurance	
	Consultation	X
	Board request	X

Why is this report coming to the Board?

To gain cross organisational action to reduce impact of poor air quality on health

To seek support for West Yorkshire Low Emission Strategy

What are the key issues for the Board?

Air quality is an emerging and increasing threat to the populations health

To mitigate that threat organisations are requested to consider practical actions they can undertake to reduce the harm from poor air quality

What possible actions can the Board take?

To support the introduction of a West Yorkshire low emission strategy To demonstrate leadership on this issue by introducing actions that reduce the harm caused by poor air quality

Contact for more information on this report

Paul Butcher Director of public Health

Should this report be exempt

No

Report to Calderdale Health and Wellbeing Board

Subject Air quality In Calderdale

1. Purpose of Report

- a) To advise the board of the health harms caused by poor air quality.
- b) To gain cross organisational action to reduce impact of poor air quality on health
- c) To seek support for West Yorkshire Low Emission Strategy

2. Recommendations

It is recommended the health and well being board confirms support for the West Yorkshire low emission strategy

It is recommended the Director of Public health enter into discussion as to the process of how such a strategy can be adopted / integrated into organisational policies.

Each constituent organisation examines the practical actions outlined in Appendix 1 for consideration within their organisational policies and future work plans

3. Background and Information

Most of Calderdale benefits from very good air quality and, overall, air quality has improved relative to air pollution levels experienced by previous generations.

However, traffic in our urban centres and on busy roads result in levels of air pollution which have a significant impact on the health of the population, with those having underlying health conditions being most at risk.

There are two pollutants of greatest concern: Nitrogen Dioxide (NO2) and Particulate Matter (PMn), which have an adverse affect on health and are a mainly a problem because of vehicle exhaust emissions, with diesel exhaust emissions contributing most to the air pollution problem.

Unlike the smoke and smog problems of the past, nitrogen dioxide and particulate matter are invisible, leading to a perception that the air is "clean".

However, particulate matter is so fine that it is inhaled deep into the respiratory tract and, in the case of very fine particles and nitrogen dioxide may transfer into the blood stream. A range of health problems are attributed to exposure to

high levels of nitrogen dioxide and particulate matter, the most obvious being respiratory conditions, asthma and cardio-vascular disease, but evidence is now also showing an association with cancer, strokes, low birth-weight babies and even childhood cognitive development. These health conditions impact both on quality of life and life expectancy. The Public Health Outcomes Indicator for air pollution points to the equivalent of one in twenty deaths in West Yorkshire each year being attributable to poor air quality.

Evidence suggests that poor air quality causes the equivalent of approximately a thousand deaths each year across West Yorkshire, with over 11,000 life years being lost. The impact of poor air quality not only results in direct health impact on individuals, but also results in increased burdens on the NHS and Social Services and wider society. Across the UK the cost of poor air quality has been estimated to be over £16billion per year.

It is estimated that mortality attributable to air pollution will be responsible for approximately 180 deaths per year in Calderdale. This may well lead to identifying air pollution to be second only to smoking as the leading cause of death in our area.

Nitrogen dioxide and particulates, together with other air pollutants, have been set an upper air quality limit value that the general population should not be exposed to and are legally binding through EU and UK law. The urban areas of West Yorkshire have been identified as having some of highest levels of air pollution in the UK, with only London showing higher levels at a regional level. Current projections indicate that concentrations of nitrogen dioxide will not fall below the limit values in some parts of West Yorkshire until after 2030.

Continued failure to meet the limit values will put the UK Government at risk of legal action being taken against it under European law, with the further risk of any fine imposed on the UK Government being passed down to local authorities if their action, or in-action, has contributed to the limit value being exceeded. Legal action has already been taken against the UK Government by Client Earth for the continued breach of the limit values in both the European Courts and UK Supreme Court It is therefore important, not least for the protection of public health, that all public bodies work together to achieve compliance with the limit values by the earliest possible date.

Ttraffic-related air pollution is the main reason why people are exposed to levels of air pollution which can damage health, but our society and economy is structured around the effective and efficient movement of people and goods. The challenge is to reduce emissions, without adversely impacting on the economy and our social expectations. Conversely, this is also an opportunity for our society and economy to benefit from the innovation and activity that will lead us to a low emission future.

No single action will lead to improved air quality, but a range of actions and activity is required at a local, regional, national and European level in order to achieve the desired reduction in emissions.

In response to these drivers the West Yorkshire local authorities, together with West Yorkshire Combined Authority and Public Health England, have developed a draft West Yorkshire Low Emission Strategy (WYLES), in order to implement a range of measures, both policy and practical, to reduce emissions, achieve compliance with the Air Quality Directive and improve health outcomes.

This Strategy considers the local and regional activity required to reduce emissions, having regard to the national and European context. The Strategy is a collaboration between West Yorkshire authorities and recognises that the actions that will have greatest impact are ones which are implemented across the region, such as regional transport policy, economic growth, housing, spatial planning, infrastructure developments and behaviour change.

The current draft WYLES has been developed by officers with relevant technical expertise, but now requires further input from wider stakeholders and consultation with the public, before final consideration for approval by each local authority and WYCA.

The strategy has 4 main themes:

- Evidence for change
- Creating a low emissions future
- Reducing Transport Emissions
- Controlling emissions from non-transport sources.

The first theme: *Evidence for Change*, explores the evidence which is driving the need for change, including the impact on health and the legal consequences of not taking action. Evidence arising from Low Emission Zone feasibility studies and work by local authorities in their role in assessing local air quality has identified where air quality is poor and what causes the main air pollution problems. We know that older diesel vehicles cause the most significant air quality issues and exposure to poor air quality is highest in urban areas, and when people live near to busy roads areas of traffic congestion.

Evidence suggests that action targeting the most polluting vehicles which operate mainly in urban areas, for example older diesel buses, will achieve the most significant air quality and health benefits. Action to improve air quality can, in most cases, also deliver additional benefits by reducing carbon dioxide emissions and reducing environmental noise.

The second theme: *Creating a Low Emission Future*, considers what needs to be done to shape the places where we live and work, how we travel and the choices we make so that low emission travel becomes part of normal everyday life.

The WYLES will help inform other strategies and policies to achieve this. Notable strategic plans include the Single Transport Plan and Strategic Economic Plans developed by WYCA, and Local Development Plans produced by Planning Authorities, but other policies and plans, for example on Carbon Management, Procurement and Commissioning of Services can also influence how the low emission future is achieved and how the places where we work and live are shaped. An *Air Quality & Planning Technical Guide* has been developed as part of the WYLES to assess the air quality impact from new development and help quantify the level of mitigation required to make developments sustainable. The West Yorkshire Authorities will use this Guide to help shape new developments, for example by creating electric charging infrastructure, so that ultra-low emission vehicles become a realistic and viable alternative for more people.

Changing behaviour is a key element of delivering a low emission future. The car has become, and will continue to be, a part of everyday life for most people, but increasingly people are interested in alternative travel options and journey planning, with active travel (walking and cycling) – the ultimate low emission vehicle – being increasingly important. The WYLES can be used to compliment the travel planning and active travel strategies across West Yorkshire.

The WYLES will also help raise awareness of the impact that emissions, particularly from vehicles, have on air quality and health. It can be confusing based on vehicle emission standards and there are complexities around picture: for many years diesel engines have been seen as better for the environment because of their lower CO2 emissions compared to petrol, but we know that diesel engines emit higher levels of nitrogen dioxide and particulates than their petrol equivalent and so contribute more to air quality problems.

The WYLES will help to educate and inform so that everyone, from key decision makers to individuals considering their next vehicle purchase, will be better informed about the health and environmental consequences of the choices and decisions they make.

Low Emission Zones (LEZ) are one way in which local authorities can regulate emissions from vehicles in urban centres, by only allowing vehicles into zoned areas which emit a low level of exhaust emissions. Most modern towns and cities benefit from some form of traffic management, for example pedestrianised areas, cycle-only routes, bus-lanes and bus-gates are now an integral part of town and city centres. However, outside London, there are very few traffic management areas implementing such schemes. Low Emission Zone feasibility studies have been carried out for Leeds and Bradford and these are considered in the WYLES. Although LEZs can reduce vehicle emissions within a defined area, more work needs to be undertaken in terms of the practical implementation and economic impact of implementing Low Emission Zones, but remain an option for regulatory control if voluntary measures fail to achieve the aims of this Strategy.

Creating a Low Emission Future will also require public authorities to lead by example. Local authorities operate over 3,000 fleet vehicles and employ over 30,000 thousand people across the region which provides the potential to influence the uptake of low emission vehicles, both as part of their business operations and in the wider population. Local authorities will carry out fleet reviews to see how low emission vehicles can be incorporated into the vehicle mix, and will promote the uptake of ultra-low emission vehicles with their own employees. Public authorities can also influence others through the commissioning of services and the procurement of goods and so consideration will be given to how this influence can be used to encourage contractors and service providers to reduce their emissions when awarding contracts.

Theme 3 – *Reducing Transport Emissions,* considers each of the main transport modes which contribute to local air pollution problems. The emphasis is on reducing overall emissions by moving to cleaner fuels and technologies, such as electric, hybrid-electric, natural gas, LPG and hydrogen, and also reducing emissions from conventional diesel and petrol driven vehicles. There are many factors to be taken into account when choosing a new vehicle, whether this be an individual, bus company, taxi driver or fleet manager. Decisions are heavily influenced by previous purchase choices and affordability – particularly initial purchase price. Because alternative fuels and technologies are relatively new to the market there is greater uncertainty about choosing something different and initial purchase costs can seem prohibitive. Work is required to better understand the barriers to ULEV uptake and work with individuals and companies to make low emission vehicles a viable and affordable alternative. The following transport modes are considered in the WYLES:

• Private Cars – Car use is a part of everyday life for most people, but with nearly one million cars in the region, accounting for 78% of the 9.8 billion miles driven on West Yorkshire roads each year, they are a significant contributor to overall emissions which impact on air guality. Diesel cars have also grown in popularity, with a three-fold increase in the last decade, however diesel cars can produce 22 times more particulate exhaust emissions and four times more NOx emissions than petrol cars, which is one of the reasons why air quality targets have not been achieved across the UK. Ultra-low emission vehicles, such as plug-in electric cars, are becoming increasingly popular as more people are seeing the benefits that ULEVs can bring, including: lower running costs, zero road tax, Government "plug-in grant" towards purchase costs as well as the environmental benefits. However, ULEVs still represent less than 0.05% of cars in West Yorkshire and more work needs to be done to promote ultra-low emission vehicles as a viable option for more people. Emissions from traditional (diesel and petrol) engine technology will reduce as new cars come into the market, but this will take a long time and therefore the WYLES will support the growth of ultra-low emission fuels and technologies in the region.

• **Buses** – as a public transport option, buses are part of the solution, but, because they are mainly diesel powered, also contribute to the air pollution problem; particularly in towns and cities where air quality is poorest. Bus companies typically operate buses for a long time and older buses produce higher emissions than modern equivalents. The majority of bus services are operated by private companies on a commercial basis, however, the WYLES will be used to support bus operators to accelerate bus replacement programmes; operate newer, cleaner buses in urban areas; fit NOx and particulate abatement technology on buses; and consider low emission

alternatives in order to reduce emissions from buses.

• **Trains** – trains, like buses, are part of the public transport solution, however, a considerable number of train routes in the region have not been electrified and therefore diesel engines continue to be used and contribute to the overall air pollution problem, particularly in urban stations, such as Leeds and Bradford. The WYLES supports the move to electrify more train routes in the region and reduce the reliance on diesel engine trains.

• Commercial Vehicles and Freight – West Yorkshire has some of the busiest strategic motorway networks in the UK and is a hub for major logistics and distribution companies. Consequently, the number of HGVs on the road network contribute significantly to overall air pollution. Recent years have also seen an increase in the number of light goods vehicles (LGVs), which may be attributed to an increase in internet sales, home deliveries and growth in the independent service sector and trades. The commercial sector can be difficult to influence, but they understand the need to reduce their carbon footprint, improve their "green" credentials and be socially responsible for the impact they have on the environment. The WYLES will aim to support the commercial sector to reduce emissions from their fleet operations, for example by supporting driver training programmes to reduce fuel costs and assisting companies to understand whole-life costs of vehicles and support alternative, low emission fuels and technologies such as compressed natural gas (CNG), liquefied natural gas (LNG), dual fuel, electric and plug-in electric and hydrogen fuel options.

• Taxis and Private Hire Vehicles – Nearly 11,000 thousand taxis and private hire vehicles operate West Yorkshire region and most are diesel cars or vans. The majority of journeys are short journeys in town and city centres and therefore contribute to overall air pollution. However, as well as being a contributor to the pollution problem, taxis and private hire can be part of the. solution, by show-casing the potential for low-emission vehicles and "normalising" their use to the thousands of passengers they carry each year. The WYLES will encourage and support taxi and private hire operators to switch to low emission alternatives and consider what policy incentives will support taxi and private hire operators to make the change.

• Local Authority Fleet – local authorities operate over 3,000 cars, vans and heavy goods vehicles, such as refuse disposal and highway maintenance vehicles as part of their fleet operations. Local authority employees also use their own cars, the so-called "grey fleet", for business journeys. The WYLES will seek to increase the number of low emission vehicles and ultra-low emission vehicles in both the local authority fleet and grey fleet. The West Yorkshire Low Emissions Procurement Guide has been developed in support of the WYLES to assist with the whole life costing of vehicles to balance potentially higher purchase costs, but lower running costs of low emission vehicles compared to traditional fuel types and help inform procurement decisions. Policy incentives, such as salary sacrifice schemes for low emission vehicles, will also be considered to incentivise uptake of privately owned ultra-low emission vehicles.

Theme 4 – **Controlling Emissions from non-Transport Sources**, considers the other contributing factors to air quality problems in West Yorkshire. The focus of this Strategy is predominantly around reducing emissions from transport, but there are also other sources which contribute to air pollution. Some emerging initiatives intended to reduce CO2 emissions, including Combined Heat & Power and District Heating schemes and the trend for biomass or wood burning, may have unintended consequences in terms of making air quality worse. The WYLES will raise awareness of these potential conflicts and promote sustainable energy and heat production which do not have an adverse impact on air quality

4. Key Issues/Next Steps

It is recommended the health and well being board confirms support for the West Yorkshire low emission strategy

It is recommended the Director of Public health enter into discussion as to the process of how such a strategy can be adopted / integrated into organisational policies.

Each constituent organisation examines the practical actions outlined in Appendix 1 for consideration within their organisational policies and future work plans

For further information on this report, contact:

[Click **here** and type your name] Telephone: E-mail: [Click **here** and type your job title], 01422 [Click **here** and type your telepone number] [Click **here** and type your e-mail]

The documents used in the preparation of this report are:

- 1. West Yorkshire low emission strategy
- 2.
- 3.

The documents are available for inspection at:

Appendix 1

Ideas for action within and cross organisations

- installation of electric vehicle recharge points within all small developments
 - consider composition of organisations own fleet- use of high visibility EVs and LEVs, restricting short journeys by car, 'No car' days etc.
 - Support for the private motorist using EVs/LEVs by way of (e.g.) onstreet, off-street and residential- parking incentives. Reviewing parking standards that promote multiple car ownership.
 - Car clubs (avoid high emission vehicles).
 - Promote <u>sustainable</u> active travel to school, starting with primary schools.
 - Phase out mileage payments to diesel users.
 - Promote and incentivise active travel in journeys under 3 miles for all our staff
 - Utilise media and communication opportunities to promote active travel
 - Consideration and procurement of Low Emission Vehicles (LEV) such as electric, hybrid vehicles and gas vehicles must form part of any sustainable public transport system. There is opportunities for funding from the government, private operators must be encouraged to apply for such funding
 - Public Authorities across West Yorkshire procure £billions of goods and services. Emission reduction must be encouraged through procurement policies which encourage private business to address their emissions.
 - In City and town centres diesel taxi use must be disincentivised, this could be done through changes to licensing policy, encouraging LEV modes through priority parking spaces for LEVs and provision of infrastructure such as EV charging points.
- Implement Travel Plans including agreed mechanisms for discouraging high emission vehicle use and encouraging modal shift (i.e. public transport, cycling and walking) as well as the uptake of low emission fuels and technologies.
- Improved pedestrian links to public transport stops.

- Provision of new bus stops infrastructure including shelters, raised kerbing, information displays.
- Provision of subsidised or free ticketing (Corporate and residential Metrocards, Student Metrocards).
- Site layout to include improved pedestrian pathways to encourage walking.
- Improved convenient and segregated cycle paths to link to local cycle network.

Support measures to reduce the need to travel:

- Alternative working practices flexitime, teleworking, homeworking, videoconferencing, compressed work periods.
- Local sourcing of staff, products and raw materials.
- Development and use of hub distribution centres employing low emission deliveries.
- Provision of discounted on-site shopping, eating, child-care, banking facilities.

Support measures to reduce polluting motorised vehicle use:

- Development of car clubs and car sharing with financial incentives and promotion.
- Use of pooled low emission vehicles cars, vans, taxis, bicycles.
- Support smart driving training schemes.
- Provision of dedicated low emission shuttle bus including managed pick-up and drop-off.
- Contribution to the emerging low emission vehicle refuelling infrastructure.
- Contribution to site low emission waste collection services.
- Incentives for the take-up of low emission vehicle technologies and fuels.

Measures to support improved public transport:

- Provision of new or enhanced public transport services to the site.
- Shuttle services to public transport interchange, rail station or park and ride facilities.
- Support improving information systems for public transport.
- Supporting city free bus expansion schemes.
- Promoting low emission bus service provision.
- Support air quality monitoring programmes.

Further measures to promote walking and cycling:

- Improvements to district walking and cycling networks including lighting, shelters, and information points and timetables.
- Support cycle training and awareness schemes.
- Bike/e-bike hiring schemes.
- Guaranteed ride home in emergencies.
- Support secure and safe cycle parking facilities.

Measures to promote sustainable travel plans:

- Support local travel to school and school travel plans initiatives.
- Marketing aimed at persuading a switch to sustainable modes with incentives;
- Promotion of subsidised/sponsored travel plan measures through social and other media.
- Supporting community/ local organisation groups to promote sustainable travel.

Our Ref:
Your Ref:Please contact:Councillor Tim SwiftTelephone:01422 393151Fax:01422 392399Email:councillor.tswift@calderdale.gov.ukDate:29 October 2015



Economy and Environment

Northgate House Northgate Halifax West Yorkshire HX1 1UN

DEFRA Air Quality Plans Team Area 2C Nobel House 17 Smith Square London SW1P 3JR

Dear Sir

Draft Air Quality Plan to achieve EU air quality limit value for nitrogen dioxide (NO₂) in West Yorkshire Urban Area (UK0004) and Yorkshire and Humberside area (UK0034)

I write with reference to the above plans, insofar as they relate to Calderdale Metropolitan Borough Council.

Please find below this council's response to the consultation questions:

Q1: Do you consider that the proposed plan set out in the overview document strikes the right balance between national and local roles?

The draft plans state that "in keeping with the localism agenda, the principal responsibility for implementing geographically targeted measures will rest with relevant local authorities."

We do not believe the proposed plan strikes the right balance. It appears to give the local authority all the responsibility for tackling air quality problems but none of the power to do this effectively. Achieving limit values more reflects matters outside of local control.

We believe that the responsibility for complying with the Air Quality Directive rests with the government, eg matters such as the increase in the vehicle fleet and in diesel-engine vehicles in particular, and the failure of vehicle emission standards and of vehicle manufacturers to properly reflect real world conditions.

The local authority duty is focussed on local air quality management, where there is relevant exposure to pollutants at levels above the air quality objective, and with a duty to pursue the achievement of the objective. Areas of modelled exceedence of EU limit values usually do not accord with Air Quality Management Areas based on local measurement and known exposure.

Whether in respect of achieving air quality objectives or limit values, as a small council we remain in the most challenging financial situation. It is difficult to plan investment or to access funding streams that rely on matched capital funding or ongoing revenue support. The ongoing



delay in reviewing and changing the LAQM regime adds to continued uncertainty. The draft 0004 and 0034 plans to achieve limit values lack an explicit government commitment to fund the actions outlined at local authority level, which could also help towards achieving AQOs. Given their projection that Calderdale will achieve the LVs by 2020 – and we have our doubts that we will - we expect that funding opportunities and awards will focus on other councils projected to exceed LVs at 2020.

We are concerned by the expectation for local authorities to impose Clean Air Zones to achieve LVs. There seems to be little consideration to the economic, social or environmental impacts inside the zones or the effect on health, amenity or road safety outside the zones. It appears that the Government is over-relying on zones to achieve short-term goals. One could even say that encouraging development and hence traffic-related emissions in areas of projected LV exceedence is simply wrong, and there should be intervention possible to direct new developments away from such areas.

The overall indication of the plans is that we must refocus our attention on achieving LVs. This can only mean diverting meagre resources away from implementing actions that are necessary to reduce exposure within AQMAs. We believe that the government should have a more coherent longer term plan for road transport and new development, one which is appropriately funded for delivery at a local level.

Q2: Are you aware of any other action happening in your area which will improve air quality and should be included in the plan? If yes, please identify as far as you are able:

a. What the additional actions are;

b. The zone(s) in which they are being taken; and

c. What the impact of those actions might be (quantified impacts would be particularly useful)".

Table C1 of plans 0004 and 0034 each list the same 6 sets of actions intended by Calderdale. In turn they derive from a request from the government made in early 2015 to set out what actions we were hoping to take. It should be noted that they are not qualified by the level of pollution savings to be achieved, or that any pollutant saving will necessarily be specific to or benefit areas of LV exceedence.

We can advise that the draft West Yorkshire Low Emission Strategy referred to in those actions is due to be opened for public consultation imminently. In most cases the implementation of any action extends well beyond 2020, and that implementation is consequent on adequate funding.

The West Yorkshire area has ambition to create a step-change in the number of ultra-low emission vehicles in the region. We have submitted a bid for funding under the Go Ultra-low City Scheme administered by OLEV. We await the outcome of this bid application in November 2015.

Q3: Within the zone plans there are a number of measures we are unable to quantify the impact. They are included in the tables of measures. Do you have any evidence for the impact of these types of measures?

Table C1 of plans 0004 and 0034 each list the same 6 sets of actions intended by Calderdale. They are not qualified by the level of pollution savings to be achieved, or that any pollution saving will necessarily be specific to or benefit areas of LV exceedence. However we do expect that the matters they cover will benefit both areas of LV exceedence and AQMAs, and the Borough as a whole. Each of the areas of LV exceedence are major commuter routes. Notwithstanding what actions this council takes these routes will continue to be used for commuting and as long as the government lacks a more coherent long term plan for road transport and new development, appropriately funded for delivery at a local level, Calderdale may have limited influence to bring to bear on that matter.

Q4: Do you agree that a consistent framework for Clean Air Zones, outlined in section 4.3.6 of the UK overview document, is necessary? If so, do you think the criteria set out are appropriate?

Yes, but we repeat our concern above about the apparent reliance on and ability of CAZ to achieve LV compliance, and the impacts that CAZ measures might exert outside the zones themselves.

It also seems inconsistent that when the draft plans associate the rise in poor air quality with diesel LGVs that the CAZ framework is aimed at HGVs and buses. We agree that there should be a framework to ensure consistent application of CAZ measures across any part of the country affected by LV exceedence, rather than measures being portrayed as the whim of individual councils, and with the government providing the necessary funding for standardised signage and enforcement eg via ANPR cameras.

Q5: What do you consider to be the barriers that need to be overcome for local authorities to take up the measures set out in section 4 of the UK overview document? How might these be overcome? Are there alternative measures which avoid these barriers?

- **Cost:** the initial cost of ULEVs is still considered prohibitive by the majority of people. Without further incentives and publicity it remains unclear how the UK will transition to ULEVs over the necessary timescale.
- **Recharging infrastructure:** Our experience is that this is patchy and uncoordinated across the UK. The driver has no guarantee that a recharge facility in a public place will be both available and in a working condition when needed. The potential operator is faced with unattractive contracts from installers and power suppliers which can discourage installation. Locating EV recharge points can conflict with the need to maximise income from available parking provisions and locating them in 'prime' locations to incentivise uptake can conflict with a disabled person's parking need.

The travel range of an EV should suffice for most commuter needs and so recharge is only necessary at home or perhaps at work. We believe that recharge facilities should be installed in all new development benefitting from dedicated off-street parking. There will remain a smaller need for long distance travellers for a national framework of rapid EV recharging facilities. We would like to see the government exploring the suitability of other fuels for long distance travel.

- Education: a Government-led and funded education campaign which raises awareness, dispels the myths and promotes the uptake of ULEVs and raises awareness about the environmental and health impact from more polluting vehicles.
- **Commercial investment and support:** Change will only come if the government drives it and industry supports it. We specifically recall the issues promoting the change from leaded to unleaded petrol: vehicle manufacturers and fuel retailers blamed each other for

poor availability of and demand for the fuel. Once the government created a significant tax differential between leaded and unleaded petrol neither vehicle manufacturers nor fuel retailers had any difficulty in meeting market demand, and that demand rose rapidly. Hence we would welcome a more supportive and positive approach to assist business to switch to ULEVs rather than a blunt and arguably 'negative' regulatory approach such as CAZ.

Q6: Are you aware of any additional action on non-transport sources to improve air quality that should be included in the plans?

The main concern with respect to non-transport sources related to locally produced energy, eg local CHP and biomass combustion. Whilst these can offer carbon reductions we need to guard against adverse impacts on local air quality, such as increased NO₂ and particulate emissions. We recommend a review of Clean Air legislation to ensure that appliances and fuels approved for use in Smoke Control Areas adequately reflect the impact on local air quality and health.

This concludes the response of the council to the consultation.

Yours faithfully

Councillor Tim Swift Leader of Calderdale Council. Calderdale MBC

Wards Affected All

Cabinet 14th December 2015

Affordable Warmth 2015-2018

Report of the Director, Economy and Environment and the Director of Public Health

1. ISSUE

- 1.1 The (Budget) Council meeting held on 23rd February 2015, agreed that the Council would launch a £1.4 million affordable warmth scheme providing finance to improve heating and insulation to tackle cold homes, linked to ill health, excess winter deaths and fuel poverty.
- 1.2 This report sets out a comprehensive 3 year programme of works to deliver Affordable Warmth to vulnerable Calderdale households.

2. NEED FOR A DECISION

2.1 The decision requested is to agree the priorities for the Affordable Warmth Programme of works to maximise the prevention of cold related ill health, reduce the number of excess winter deaths attributed to cold homes and lower fuel bills for vulnerable residents of Calderdale.

3. **RECOMMENDATIONS**

- 3.1 Members are recommended to
 - 3.1.1 Approve the programme of works set out at 6
 - 3.1.2 Delegate the authority to refine, deliver and monitor the programme of works to the Director of Public Health, Director of Economy and Environment in consultation with the Cabinet members with responsibility for Public Health, Well Being and Engagement and Skills and the Environment
 - 3.1.3 Request the Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel receive and consider regular 6 monthly reports about programme progress from the Affordable Warmth Programme Board.

4. BACKGROUND TO THE AFFORDABLE WARMTH PROGRAMME

- 4.1 At the budget council meeting held on 23rd February 2015, it was agreed that the Council would launch a £1.4 million Affordable Warmth scheme from 2016/17 onwards providing finance to improve heating and insulation to tackle cold homes, which ae linked to ill health and winter deaths.
- 4.2 In March 2015 an Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel Review made the following recommendations to Cabinet following an in depth review of the effects of the environment on health and well-being.
 - 4.2.1 **Recommendation 4** That the Portfolio Holder / Cabinet and the Director, Economy and Environment be requested to take note of and consider the evidential research previously undertaken by the Chartered Institute of Environmental Health and the Building Research Establishment (BRE) which suggests that targeting the Borough's worst housing with a £1.4 million investment programme could save an estimated £4.65m in health care costs (for the over 60s).
 - 4.2.2 **Recommendation 9** That Cabinet be informed that it should request a policy paper as soon as possible on how the £1.4m affordable warmth scheme recently agreed by Council providing grants to improve heating and insulation was to be implemented and it is recommended that that the Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel could be used as "sounding board" on this important piece of policy development work. Links to public health, hospital trust and Adults Health and Social Care, the Better Care Fund and the work of the Health and Well-Being Board would also needed to be considered in taking this work forward.
- 4.3 The United Kingdom has one of the highest excess winter death rates in Europe with thousands of people dying prematurely every year because of excessive cold temperatures in their home during winter
- 4.4 In 2013 there were 94 excess winter deaths (EWD)in Calderdale, i.e. the number of additional deaths that occurred during the colder winter months of December to March, compared to the average number of deaths that occur during the rest of the year.
- 4.5 Conservative estimates from the World Health Organisation indicated that around 30% of EWD could be attributed to cold indoor temperatures. Effectively this meant that around 31 people died in the winter of 2012/13 due to cold housing in the winter months. The other 70% of EWDs were due to other factors such as exposure to the cold from being out and about.
- 4.6 The scrutiny panel recognised the importance of collecting, sharing and analysing good data to target work to improve affordable warmth across the Borough.
- 4.7 In addition, they found that fuel-poor households are more likely to live in energy inefficient homes across all tenures compared to non-fuel poor households. Private tenants are at the greatest risk of severe fuel poverty owing to having lower than average incomes compared to owner occupiers and living in the least energy efficient properties compared to social housing tenants.

- 4.8 Scrutiny panel found that the main interventions to tackle fuel poverty and cold homes spanned four main areas:
 - 4.8.1 Energy efficiency measures increasing the energy efficiency of homes through loft and cavity wall insulation and efficient heating thereby improving thermal comfort and affordability of energy bills as well as future proofing homes against fuel poverty;
 - 4.8.2 Energy price support and switching to ease the burden of high energy costs, for example through the Warm Home Discount, and to facilitate access to cheaper energy tariffs where possible;
 - 4.8.3 Providing advice and support that help people to overcome personal and structural barriers to keeping warm in their home such as problems with using heating controls; and
 - 4.8.4 Maximising income –access to welfare benefits to which individuals and families are entitled and providing advice.
- 4.9 Scrutiny panel also discussed and encouraged partnership working particularly with health colleagues and the use of enforcement powers under the Housing Act 2004 and Energy Performance Certificate legislation
- 4.10 There was recognition of the work carried out nationally by the Chartered Institute of Environmental Health and the Building Research Establishment (BRE) to evidence the cost of cold homes (and the cost of other hazards in the home). The BRE have now carried out detailed analysis for Calderdale and included a Health Impact Assessment. Figure 1, below shows the cost of common hazards in the home in terms of NHS expenditure nationally.



Figure 1 – The cost of hazards in the home to NHS
5. BACKGROUND - TARGETING RESOURCES & ADDED VALUE

- 5.1 A project board has been established to set objectives, oversee the design of the programme, monitor the projects and measure the effectiveness against the objectives. The board is chaired by the Director of Public Health and includes membership from Housing, Environmental management, Benefits, Environmental Health, Children's Services and Adults, Health and Social Care. The importance of working with external organisations was highlighted during a recent consultation event.
- 5.2 The research by the Building Research Establishment (BRE) to model the housing stock, identify Homes in Multiple Occupation (HMOs), where hazards are likely to occur, demographic information and a property level Health Impact Assessment has just reported back. There are interesting findings confirming some of the local intelligence. An interesting observation of the data is that Ward level information often masks some small pockets of fuel poverty, for example within Northowram and Shelf is a Census Output Area with one of the highest levels of fuel poverty and inefficient homes, but the overall ward level is less than average.
- 5.3 Previous exemplary work identifying the difficulties associated with improving the energy efficiency of the older housing stock in the Borough 'Hard to Treat or Hard to Fund' has been considered in putting together a programme of works suitable for Calderdale. Energy company subsidy through the Energy Company Obligation instrument is currently very low, particularly for properties that are expensive to treat, however it will be maximised wherever possible to supplement the insulation and heating work required for the coldest homes.
- 5.4 A multi-agency stakeholder consultation event was held on the 16th November 2015 to discuss how funds could be best deployed to maximise affordable warmth in Calderdale. Participants were from many third sector organisations as well as health, community workers and some private sector, 40 people attended. The BRE research assisted participants to understand the effect and whereabouts of cold homes in Calderdale and the scale of the problem. Better Homes also presented to the event, showing how additional funds could be attracted to boost the local funding.
- 5.5 This has contributed to the consideration of how to target geographic areas and socio-economic groups that most need help to make their homes warmer, healthier and cheaper to heat through the Affordable Warmth programme. They also considered the merits of loans rather than grants to maximise how many households would ultimately benefit from the programme from the recycled funds.
- 5.6 The participants had a range of views, some of the stronger views expressed include
 - 5.6.1 Work closely across different organisations to avoid duplication and maximise efficiency there is work already planned and funded, this can be complemented with the Council's Affordable Warmth Programme by good referral networks.
 - 5.6.2 Use carrot and stick methods of proactive work with private landlords (funds for enforcement and works in default of notices, but also advice for landlords).
 - 5.6.3 Use loans where possible to enable the funds to be used more than once

- 5.6.4 A comprehensive approach to include emergency measures, advice and long term improvements. Target groups by tenure, health need, age and area.
- 5.6.5 Publicity and information for organisations and the public.
- 5.7 **Better Homes Calderdale -** Backed by the Council, Better Homes is the energy efficiency project available for all owner occupiers, private rented tenants and private landlords throughout Calderdale and 8 other local authorities in the Leeds City Region.

Better Homes will access the best rates for Energy Company Obligation (ECO) and any other sources of finance to subsidise energy efficiency and heating efficiency schemes for property owners

As part of the exclusivity agreement, officers can now only recommend the Better Homes scheme for all energy efficiency work for all privately owned homes in the area. Anyone who owns their own home can arrange an energy assessment through the scheme and a quote for any of the work recommended.

- 5.8 **European Funds** There is a potential for using some of the funds for works which could also attract match funding from Europe. If bids are successful there are some large financial gains for work in the Borough.
- 5.9 **Other funds** There are funds which other organisations in Calderdale already have access to which are complementary projects to the overall programme, by working together, the funds can bring multiple benefits. For example, the Citizens Advice Bureau have short term funds for assisting people to switch to the best energy tariff for them.
- 5.10 **Recycling funds** Home and Loans is administered by Sheffield City Council for the Yorkshire and Humberside region authorities. They have around £6 million loaned to residents in the region for home improvements. As these are repaid, the funds available for new loans is growing and in response Homes and Loans have developed a new product for repayment loans for energy improvement works. The products come with training for staff to enable them to ensure repayments are affordable or to recommend equity loans as an alternative.

6. OPTIONS CONSIDERED

- 6.1 The provision of more grants would make the programme accessible to the households in the worst financial circumstances but would limit the number of households benefiting. The provision of more loans than grants would establish a revolving fund to benefit more vulnerable households.
- 6.2 Due to the changing nature of additional funding availability a degree of flexibility is requested from members in order to be able to react quickly to funding opportunities, shifting funds from one project to another if other funds become available e.g. through the WYCA Investment Growth Fund, Better Homes funding, Department of Climate Change etc.
- 6.3 The Area Improvement (Project 1, Figure 2 below) would only go ahead if funds became available to make it affordable and would be subject to agreement with property owners. This highlights the need for some flexibility in delivering the Affordable Warmth Programme.

6.4 Appendix 1 includes a summary of each of the proposed projects, following consideration of the BRE research, Health Impact Assessment and the consultation event on the 16th November 2015, below is an option of how this could be built into a programme of works. There are some projects included which may need additional revenue funding in order to proceed, they are included here to give a picture of the complete programme. Revenue funds may become available from other organisations and applications will be made as opportunities arise.

						Househo	
						ld est.	
					No. of	savings	
			Match		house	in 10	
Ref	Project	Total	funds	Loan	holds	years	Comments
1	Area improvement – Beech Hill	£400,000	Yes	Yes	71	£390,500	Insulated new roofs with PV tiles, external wall insulation. Project subject to availability of match funds from Europe & partners
2	Affordable Warmth Finance	£610,000	Yes	Yes	610	£1,830,000	Insulation, heating and controls finance repayment & equity loans, small grants in emergencies. Some energy company subsidy will cover part of the cost of works
3	Private Rented Improvements	£240,000	No	Some	1000	£2,000,000	Project will help landlords with colder properties bring them up to standard. Information and enforcement e.g. Energy Performance Certificates (EPCs) and Housing Act.
4	Energy Advice, and tariffs e.g. CAB, Green Dr	£90,000*	No	No	3500	£4,200,000	Give energy advice, find best price for fuel (CAB doing this 2015/16) and engage customers in other projects of the Affordable Warmth programme
5	Marketing & promotion	£30,000*	No	No	All		General marketing for all affordable warmth work in the Borough, use of social media and electronic promotions where possible
6	Warmth on prescription scheme (boilers)	£150,000	Yes	Some	150	£375,000	Healthcare costs modelled at £0.42 per year for every £1 invested, target people with cold affected conditions
7	Fuel bank £50 pre-payment card emergency top ups	£30,000*	No	No	600	£30,000	One off emergency funding per household only. Funds from elsewhere as not capital works
	Totals	£1.4M		difpor	5710	£7.985M	

*Revenue schemes, funds to be found if possible, may need external source; some may be funded by fees for officer time resulting in capital work

Figure 2 – Illustration of Programme of Works

7. CONSULTATION

- 7.1 Consultation was instigated with the Economy & Environment Scrutiny Panel Review
- 7.2 An Affordable Warmth Board was formed to bring together all Directorates of the Council to discuss the programme design. This is chaired by the Director of Public Health.
- 7.3 On the 16th November 2015, a large event was held at the Threeways Centre to discuss the programme content, aims and objectives, who should benefits from the programme and how it would be delivered. The options for individual projects were discussed to establish priorities across the organisations, vulnerable groups and geographic areas, this is reflected in 6, above. A report of the event including participants is available.

8. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 8.1 Budget Council in February 2015 agreed the allocation into the capital programme of £1.4m for the Affordable warmth scheme to be funded by prudential borrowings. Provision of £100k per annum was made in the revenue budget from 2016/17 to fund the repayment of the prudential borrowing.
- 8.2 If funds are distributed by loans, there is the potential for a revolving pot to continue into future years.
- 8.3 Sheffield City Council administer the regional Homes and Loans, loans for householders to carry out home repairs or energy efficiency improvements, therefore the product development has already been carried out, these are relatively cheap to administer with typical costs of £70 per household including registered charge.

9. EQUALITY AND DIVERSITY

- 9.1 Living in a cold home affects everyone's health and well being but there are particular groups who are affected most. These are elderly people, young children, people with health conditions made worse by the cold (COPD, heart disease, respiratory disease).
- 9.2 Households with smaller incomes who also live in homes which are energy inefficient are affected most by fuel poverty. This may not necessarily be in the areas where multiple deprivation is worst as social housing tends to be more efficient than private sector housing.

10. CONTRIBUTION TO DELIVERING POPULATION OUTCOMES

10.1 Economy and Enterprise – By saving residents money on their fuel bills, more money will be available to be spent on other items, this may contribute significantly to the local economy. Considerable amount of work will be carried out by local building contractors and the possibility of employing trainee Environmental Health Officer. Significant savings are expected in NHS spending in terms of unplanned GP and hospital visits.

- 10.2 Environment Most of the programme of works will contribute to the required reduction in carbon dioxide emissions, to reduce the effects of climate change
- 10.3 Safer & Stronger Communities The consultation highlighted the benefits of working closely with partner organisations to maximise the effect of the programme and ensure it reaches those residents in greatest need of the assistance.
- 10.4 Healthier Communities The whole programme has the health and well-being of vulnerable Calderdale residents at it's centre, preventing ill health and reducing excess winter deaths.
- 10.5 Older People Most affected by cold weather and likely to be living in the oldest houses, most of the programme will be of benefit to older people.
- 10.6 Use of Resources Any match funds or contributions from other organisations and Government will be applied for and utilised to maximise the resources available from Council.
- 10.7 Narrowing the Gap Programme of work is aimed at the most vulnerable groups of people and will reduce their fuel bills to maximise their disposable income, narrowing the gap in terms of finance and health outcomes.

11. CORPORATE IMPLICATIONS

11.1 The Affordable Warmth programme will contribute to outcomes in all Council Directorates and across the whole Borough. It will also contribute to other public sector agendas in terms of better health and educational achievement.

12. CONCLUSION

- 12.1 The Affordable Warmth programme has the potential to significantly reduce fuel poverty in the Borough. By careful targeting, the programme will reduce ill health and will maximise income.
- 12.2 The use of loans within the programme will ensure that future incidences of fuel poverty can be tackled, with a rolling programme of works.

For further information on this report, contact:			
Helen Rhodes	Sustainable Housing & Environment Manager		
Telephone:	01422 392485		
E-mail:	Helen.rhodes@calderdale.gov.uk		

The documents used in the preparation of this report are:

- 1. Scrutiny Review March 2015 Local Environment and Health
- 2. BRE stock condition model and Health Impact Assessment for Calderdale
- 3. Hard to Treat or Hard to Fund
- 4. Report of the consultation event 16th November 2016

The documents are available for inspection at: Northgate House

Project 1 – Beech Hill Area Improvement	
Outline Proposal Built as a small Council estate just off Pellon Lane, Beech Hill has 71 flat roofed mostly 3 bedroomed houses. The area is now mixed tenure consisting of 28 owner occupiers, 27 private rented and 16 owned by Pennine Housing 2000. Household incomes in the area are low and residents struggle to adequately heat their homes because of high energy costs and the lack of insulation in the construction. The housing has been identified for an energy efficiency led regeneration scheme. Some consultation work has already been done with residents and owners as part of a master- planning exercise. A new insulated pitched roof system, incorporating solar photovoltaic tiles, along with an external insulated render would significantly reduce heat loss from the properties and improve residents' thermal comfort. The work would also improve the cosmetic appearance of the properties and enhance their value. £400k funding from the Affordable Warmth programme with ECO and PH2K funds could be used to apply for £600k match funds from Europe. European funds could subsidise the cost of works, with equity loans offered to owners. Loans would be repaid on the sale of the property. Alternative sources of funding may be available if the European bid fails Lead Partner	 Outcomes & Outputs Regeneration of the existing housing on Beech Hill estate Additional potential for new housing at Beech Hill on the site of the 3 tower blocks and possibly on the depot site Improved affordable warmth & better health Estimated energy bill savings of up to £550 per household per year Increase in house values should at least equal the amount of investment from the owners Payback (Affordable warmth loan) in 15 years not including added value to property Work for contractors Additional £600K capital attracted
Better Homes	Pennine Housing 2000
	Private landlords
	Residents
Affordable Warmth funds needed	Around £1.2M works, the £400,000 would be

Project 2 – Affordable Warmth Finance	
Outline Proposal This would be connected to projects 3, 4, 5 and possibly 6 ECO funding would be utilised to minimise the need for loans as well as property owners own funds where available Loans would be made available to the owners of properties needing insulation, efficient heating, draught-proofing, or other efficiency measures. Small emergency interventions such as emergency heaters and small heating repairs would be offered prior to further energy advice and longer term efficient heating and insulation. Repayment loans would be offered where owners are able to make repayments and equity loans offered where they ae not. The loan products have been developed by Homes & Loans (part of Sheffield City Council) and are available throughout the Region through Local Authorities. There is already a small pot of money available from previously returned regional loans If project 1 is unviable, this project could be scaled up to meet the needs of more households.	 Outcomes & Outputs Improved energy efficiency/warmth to 610 homes Average loan around £1,000 Average annual savings of £300 per household Average payback period 3 years Work for contractors Additional capital likely to match Affordable Warmth funds of £610K Recycling funds with a short repayment period to make funds available for reuse Unplanned GP and hospital visits prevented
Lead Partner • Homes & Loans Affordable Warmth funds needed £610K (can be scaled to include funds in project 1)	Other partners Better Homes Calderdale Referral organisations through-out Calderdale (Health, 3rd sector) Other Affordable Warmth projects The £610K would be repayable over a period of 3-5 years or on sale of properties

Project 3 – Private rented improvements	Outcomes & Outputs
Outline Proposal This new project aims to improve the energy efficiency of private rented homes. It will be used to provide support to landlords with appropriate advice to make capital improvements to their properties. It will also add capacity to carry out enforcement for non-compliance or other action against landlords who are unwilling to bring their properties up to the required standard. The private rented sector is now larger than the social rented sector in Calderdale and continues to grow in size. Research confirms that the private rented sector also contains some of the coldest properties and lowest income residents who are more likely to be unable to heat their homes to a reasonable standard. It became compulsory for private landlords to provide Energy Performance Certificates (EPC) for new tenants from 2012. An EPC shows the energy efficiency rating of a property on a scale of A-G, with an 'A' rating being the warmest / most energy efficient. The EPC also shows what improvements could be made to make the home more energy efficient and cheaper to heat. From 2018 onwards it will not be legal to rent out an F or G rated property. (Exclusions and exemptions will apply). From data already available there are an estimated 3,000 rented homes which may become unavailable or outside the law if nothing is done to improve them. These houses are expensive for people to live in and by improving them to at least an E rating tenants will benefit from reduced fuel bills as well as being more comfortable. Many landlords do not have a valid EPC for each of their rental properties. This may be due to a number of reasons from a general lack of awareness and understanding from accidental landlords through to intentional non-compliance from poor landlords. This project will support a proactive approach to target some of the worst housing in the private rented market (without EPC or very poor rating). Powers under the Housing Act can then be used to support or enforce improvements. There is	 Improve the efficiency rating of properties in the private rented sector in readiness for 2018 legislation by Provide help and support to landlords to improve the energy rating of their properties Use enforcement powers to make improvements and regulate the EPC system Target areas where rented properties have low EPC ratings Target areas where know rented properties have no EPC Over the 3 year period to contact all private rented property owners to invite them into the project Start enforcement activity against non-complying landlords Carry out improvement work to 500 homes by use of repayment loans Encourage improvement work to 2,500 homes Unplanned GP and hospital visits prevented
technical support. Lead Partner	Other partners
Environmental Health	 Private Landlords Trading standards Referral organisations Tenants
Affordable Warmth funds needed (see project 2) £240K Some of the cost may be reclaimed (offset with fees, prosecutions and fixed penalty notices)	Savings to tenants estimated as £2M over 10 years

Project 4 –Energy advice	Outcomes & Outputs	
Outline Proposal This would be the front end of the programme, offering advice to householders, landlords & tenants. Advice would include how to identify and move to the best tariff, how to save energy, what measures would be best to install, what projects are available in this complex and changing field, how to pay for measures and how to get them installed Include Calderdale residents in collective switches	 Clear signposting for Calderdale residents 1,200 households receiving individual advice 2,500 households taking part in collective switch 	
 Lead Partner Unknown, but could be Green Doctor, CAB etc. 	Other partners Better Homes Calderdale All referral organisations All other project leads Landlords 	
Affordable Warmth funds needed – fee chargeable if capital works are carried out Revenue funds from elsewhere £90,000	This small investment could lead to vast savings for many Calderdale residents, estimate of £4.2M over 10 years	

Project 5 – Marketing and Promotion	Outcomes & Outputs
Outline Proposal This project aims to design a marketing campaign that engages both front line professionals to help them understand the adverse consequences of living in a cold home, and also include a package of materials and items that they can use with their customers to promote the importance of keeping their home warm enough, and encourage them to access the various sources of support and schemes that can help them make their homes cheaper to heat.	 All partner and referral organisations are kept aware of all Affordable Warmth projects Residents are aware of the assistance available to them Residents are aware of how they can help themselves to reduce fuel bills
 Campaigns and promotional items could include: Social media promotion on Facebook and twitter Electronic referrals on council website that are passed on to other key partners Regular electronic Affordable Warmth newsletter & info, including case studies, for partner agencies Card mounted room thermometers Fridge magnets, key rings, pens Referral cards & scheme for energy advice, smoke alarms, benefits advice Leaflets & posters The campaign will also consider the new smart meter installation programme from 2016 onwards and the benefits smart meters will bring for lower income households through better energy management, real time and accurate billing, access to fairer tariffs, and easier process for making top up payments. 	
Lead Partner Communications staff 	 Other partners All other project leads and partners All referral organisations Better Homes Calderdale
Affordable Warmth funds needed – none possible Revenue funds from elsewhere £30,000	Savings reported elsewhere, this project to support the success of the other projects

Project 6 – Warmth on prescription	Outcomes & Outputs	
Outline Proposal This project seeks to develop better understanding and joint working between housing and health. Referrals from frontline health professionals including GPs, district nurses, hospital admission & discharge staff, social services, support and independence teams, reablement service and homecare services to ensure that vulnerable or lower income residents in the private housing sector (owned or rented) with severe, chronic or terminal cold related health conditions are	 150 unplanned GP or hospital visits prevented Savings to fuel bills in vulnerable households 	
 living in safe and warm homes. Adjustments to a Common Assessment Form could prompt health staff to ask about their patient's home, focusing on whether they have: A whole of house working heating system with controls that they know how to use A hot water supply for bathing, washing and cleaning Insulation and draught proofing to 		
reduce heat loss and improve comfort Patients without one or more of the above will be referred to the Council's Housing Energy Action Team for a priority response according to their circumstances and medical conditions. Cross referral to the above projects if these are more suitable Referral to Affordable Warmth finance if customer able to repay		
Lead Partner Better Homes Calderdale 	Other partners CCG Front line health workers Referral organisations 	
Affordable Warmth funds needed £150K	£150K works, some repayable if rented sector	

Project 7 – Fuel Bank	Outcomes & Outputs
Outline Proposal This is an emergency response intervention for very vulnerable residents without any means of buying any energy on their prepayment cards for their prepayment meters.	 600 households warm over winter Prevention of unplanned GP or hospital visits
It will fund a one off payment of £50 on resident's top card in emergency circumstances. A condition of the payment is that resident's details are taken to ensure they can be engaged with assistance through other schemes which will include:	
 Registering for their supplier's Priority Services Register service Energy advice visit for free minor works and affordable warmth advice Referral to the Better Homes scheme for insulation Support and guidance for the tenant's landlord (if in private rented accommodation) to ensure they are meeting their obligations towards the tenant Housing advice and support if issues are identified 	
Lead Partner	Other partners
Possibly CAB or CFFC	All referral organisationsBetter Homes Calderdale
Affordable Warmth funds needed – none possible Revenue funds from elsewhere £30,000	Immediate impact only