



## **A SCRUTINY REVIEW OF THE GREEN ECONOMY IN CALDERDALE**



**FINAL REPORT OF THE ECONOMY & ENVIRONMENT  
SCRUTINY PANEL**

**MARCH 2014**

## **Contents**

<u>Section</u>	<u>Page</u>
Co-Chairs' forewords	3
Background and evidence sources	5
Research and findings	6
Evidence gathering "drop-in" sessions	18
What extra we can do - our Recommendations (Appendix 1)	21
Acknowledgements (Appendices 2-4)	24

## **FOREWORDS**

### **Councillors James Baker and Jenny Lynn**

We knew that we have a number of businesses in Calderdale that offer opportunities for Calderdale people and other businesses to reduce their carbon use, make more efficient use of energy and so reduce household and business costs, as well as benefiting the environment.

In our review we wanted to champion local best practice in this field; identify any barriers to these businesses developing further; and for new business start-ups; and to identify opportunities in Calderdale to build on the existing success and entrepreneurship.

We have found excellent work in businesses and social enterprises throughout Calderdale; our recommendations will help the Council, business and communities take this forward.

The green economy is a relatively new and growing business sector and we would like to see Calderdale at the forefront of job creation in this area. We can all see the importance of the green economy and the significant role it can play in helping to influence the protection and preservation of the environment for future generations.

We are pleased to present this report of the Green Economy Detailed Scrutiny Review Group.

#### **Introduction – Councillor James Baker**

In June 2013, the Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel, decided to undertake a scrutiny review on the Green Economy in Calderdale; and also to link in to some of the work previously researched by the Panel on fuel poverty.

Before we started our review, we requested a detailed position statement from the Economy and Environment Directorate on the Calderdale Energy Future Strategy and the Green Economy. This was presented to us at our September 2013 Scrutiny Panel meeting. Following this, we agreed to set up a time-limited review group to take a more detailed look at green economy activities and initiatives being undertaken in Calderdale.

There was very keen interest from many other Members of the Council to become involved in this review work and the Panel subsequently appointed Councillors Janet Battye, Roger Taylor and Dave Young, along with our-selves to undertake this piece of work. Uniquely, we also decided to trial undertaking this review with Co-Chairs, with myself and Councillor Jenny Lynn undertaking these roles.

## Introduction – Councillor Jenny Lynn

The Panel also agreed our Terms of Reference for this review at its September 2013 meeting.

We held our first review group meeting in October 2013 and, during the course of our review, we have looked closely at how the Council works on “green” activities and initiatives, primarily within the Borough, but also taking a look at the regional and sub-regional context, such as through our links with the Leeds City Region (LCR) and its green economy lead.

We also held two “drop-in” evidence gathering events at Halifax Town Hall (December 2013 and January 2014) which were successful in allowing businesses and social and community enterprises in Calderdale involved in the green economy to let us know their views. We also conducted telephone interviews with a number of businesses on the Council’s green economy database of businesses to gauge their views.

This report, which sets out our findings on the green economy in Calderdale, also makes recommendations to the Cabinet Member, Economy and Environment, the Director Economy and Environment and other bodies as appropriate.

We would like to thank all members of the detailed review group for their time, energy and contributions in undertaking this review and to the scrutiny officers for their commitment and the hard work they have put into this exercise. A big *thank you* as well to Officers’ in the Council, particularly in the Economy and Environment Directorate, for both their “expert witness” evidence at review group meetings they attended and for providing so much of the background information.

Councillor James Baker

**James Baker**

Co- Chair, Green Economy  
Detailed Scrutiny Review  
and Deputy Chair,  
Economy and Environment  
Scrutiny Panel

Councillor Jenny Lynn

**Jenny Lynn**

Co-Chair, Green Economy  
Detailed Scrutiny Review  
and Member,  
Economy and Environment  
Scrutiny Panel

# 1 BACKGROUND

## 1.1 Working Party objectives

The Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel agreed to establish a detailed scrutiny review group during 2013/14. The review work began in October 2013, when the terms of reference for the review had been agreed and focused on:-

- understanding the current “green” economic context;
- reviewing the current *green economy* in Calderdale and policies of the Council;
- understanding the internal structures / capacity that supports the green economy in Calderdale, in particular the business relationships of the Council with Green Economy businesses;
- reviewing the effectiveness of the Calderdale Energy Future Strategy;
- reviewing the effectiveness of the Calderdale Affordable Warmth Strategy;
- examining the potential of Community Energy Generation Schemes;
- looking at the prospects for the future and any identifiable barriers to economic growth in the “green” business sector in Calderdale;
- looking at the local *green economy* and its relationship with job creation and income generation; along with the role businesses play in promoting the green economy;
- looking at how bio-diversity and conservation issues are promoted in relation to the Green Economy;
- playing an active role in seeking to influence external partners, businesses and residents by raising awareness.

## 1.2 Membership

The membership of the detailed scrutiny review group was Councillors J Baker (co-Chair), J Lynn (co-Chair), J Battye, R Taylor and D Young.

## 1.3 Background and Evidence Sources

This Scrutiny Review was established by the Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel.

During the course of our review, we received a considerable amount of background information and witness evidence from Economy and Environment Directorate officers, along with further contributions from colleagues in the Council's Corporate Asset and Facilities Management Team (CAFM), along with our Scrutiny Support Team.

External witness evidence included written submissions from the green economy Lead, Leeds City Region secretariat; telephone interviews with some of the businesses on the Council's green economy database of businesses; and attendance by a number of interested parties invited to review group meetings.

We also held two "drop-in" evidence gathering events at Halifax Town Hall (December 2013 and January 2014) which allowed businesses and social and community enterprises in Calderdale involved in the green economy to talk with us and let us know their views.

Three Members of the Review group, along with the Scrutiny Support Officer also attended the Our Energy Future event held at Calderdale College on 14<sup>th</sup> October 2013.

We also researched and referenced information sourced locally, regionally and nationally on the green economy.

## 2 OUR REVIEW WORK – OUR RESEARCH AND FINDINGS

### Our Energy Future Event / Conference – Calderdale College – Monday 14<sup>th</sup> October, 2013

- 2.1 Members of the review group accepted an invitation to attend the Calderdale energy future launch / conference held at Calderdale College on 14 October 2013.
- 2.2 At the event, we took the opportunity to visit a number of stalls and exhibitions on display provided by expert business, housing and community energy organisations and we talked to a number of exhibitors about the *green economy*, both generally and in Calderdale.
- 2.3 We also heard from a number of keynote speakers, including Robert Taylor, the Sustainability Manager at Nestle on the company's focus on energy; and from Merran McRae, Calderdale Council's Chief Executive on *Calderdale's Challenge*.

- 2.4 In addition, we participated in a number of workshops at the conference and took the opportunity to network with other attendees. The workshops that were delivered included:- *“the business motivation to save energy”*; *“Green Deal supply chain opportunities”*; *“the big picture”*; *“public sector leaders in carbon reduction”*; *“businesses taking action”*; *“DIY community energy”*; *“climate, landscape and flooding”*; and *short inspirational (green) film showings*.
- 2.5 At the conference we found out more about Calderdale Energy Future; increasing the pace of change; and on how the strategy sets out how the Council and its partners can best work together to transform our current thinking to support a resilient low carbon economy with the aim of the Borough achieving a 40% reduction in carbon emissions by 2020 from a 2005 baseline.
- 2.6 We welcomed Calderdale Council’s commitment to reducing its own emissions in line with the Borough wide target and endorsed the importance of the Council providing strong and effective leadership to inspire and enable our communities to have a role model to follow.
- 2.7 We were very impressed with the commitment of Calderdale College and the design of its new Sustainable Technology Centre (low carbon) building on Francis Street, which hosted the conference. The conference was extremely well attended, with a good mix of public, private and third sector organisations. In particular, we were very glad to see larger commercial businesses, such as Nestle, making the business case for building sustainability as an integral part of their business.

**Calderdale Council / Green Economy / Leeds City Region (LCR) and Corporate Asset and Facilities Management (CAFM)**

- 2.8 We focused at our 5 November 2013 meeting on three key issues which we had identified in our terms of reference:- *What was happening in the Council – green issues?; the green economy, Calderdale Council and its relationship with the Leeds City Region (LCR); and what energy management activities were being undertaken by our Corporate Asset and Facilities Management (CAFM) team.*

**Calderdale Council - Green Issues**

- 2.9 In respect of what was happening in the Council on green issues, we reviewed the report that had been submitted to the Scrutiny Panel on 5<sup>th</sup> September, 2013 which had provided a detailed update on the Calderdale Energy Future Strategy and the green economy.
- 2.10 We heard from Helen Rhodes, Private Sector Housing Manager and Kate Bisson, Sustainability Officer, Economy and Environment Directorate who provided a brief synopsis of the matters considered at the September 2013 Panel meeting.

- 2.11 They also provided an update on progress since that date, including an evaluation of feedback from delegates who attended the “Our Energy Future” Conference; an outline of work being undertaken by the respective Business, Housing, and Communities working groups of Calderdale Energy Future including the work being undertaken looking at the low carbon services sector; looking to extend the Environmental Business Pledge to Schools (Business Group); progress re installation of bio-mass boilers in five schools; travel – Sustainability Officer on-going work on costs and carbon emissions and working with Human Resources re Employment Policies re travel and alternative modes of transport provision; Energy Saving Trust – work surrounding the Council’s vehicle fleet and investigating potential to replacing some vehicles with electric vehicles at the end of current lease periods; Public Sector Estate Scheme (Fast charging: 3-4 hour charge) – four double charging points for electric vehicles to be added to Council estate – locations not determined as yet; cycling and cycling to work initiatives; and the work of the street lighting team – trials of use of LED lighting currently on-going on two streets in Calderdale.
- 2.12 We very much welcome the Council and partners maximising marketing and media/publicity opportunities in raising awareness of these important strands of work being undertaken to promote green issues and initiatives.

#### Calderdale Council and the Leeds City Region (LCR) - Green Issues

- 2.13 We then looked at how the Council and Leeds City Region (LCR) worked together and interacted on the green economy. We received written evidence from the LCR green economy lead, including a copy of presentation on what was happening on green issues in Leeds City Region (this presentation had also been given as part of “the big picture” workshop session at the Calderdale Energy Future event) and a copy of an LCR Investment Planning update report (October 2013)
- 2.14 We were informed that there were two ways that LCR had been working with local authorities to feed into the green economy process. Firstly through a city region-wide district heat programme, providing data information and opportunities for district heat; and secondly through the development of a list of low carbon infrastructure projects for inclusion in the Strategic Economic Plan and the European Strategy.
- 2.15 Emma Appleton, from the Council’s Environmental Management Team also attended the meeting and outlined how they were working with the Leeds City Region (LCR). She also provided the review group with a position statement, along with a paper which provided details of Calderdale’s Leeds City Region pipeline projects and proposals.
- 2.16 We found that the major LCR pipeline project and proposals that the Council was involved with were:- Project - Calderdale Renewable Energy Generation-  
(a) *Biomass production Calderdale - Interim programme of existing woodland management already appraised and needing no further permissions to deliver;*  
(b) *Park Homes Community Energy, Calderdale - Improved energy efficiency*



*and biomass installation to supply heating and hot water to 40 park homes on two sites off the gas network; (c) Community Hydro schemes Calderdale- three large schemes, along the Calder Valley, 75KW, 55KW and 23KW schemes have been subject to feasibility studies and full costing. Payback period from Feed-in Tariffs (FITs) is approximately 7 years; (d) Wind Calderdale - a detailed analysis of potential wind turbine sites has been commissioned for the whole of Calderdale, Specific sites will be identified from this and prioritised.*

### **Recommendation 1**

**That the Portfolio Holder and the Director, Economy and Environment are requested to place a greater emphasis on championing the Green Economy as a key sector within the Leeds City Region (LCR); in supporting the on-going and pipeline projects for Calderdale in the LCR; and to enable sufficient Council staff and resource to be committed to ensure Calderdale can play a full and active role in engaging with and benefiting from this green economy sector work**

#### Calderdale Council Corporate Asset and Facilities Management (CAFM) Team and Energy Management Activities

- 2.17 As part of our research we also focused on the work that was being planned and/or undertaken by our CAFM team on energy management activities.
- 2.18 We met on 5 November with Andrew Sharpe and Robert Baylis from the CAFM team with whom we discussed energy management activities they had highlighted in an information document they provided.
- 2.19 We found that an officer working group had been operating since July 2013 within CAFM and met every two weeks to develop initiatives and methods to reduce the Council's energy costs and support the Council in the reduction of carbon dioxide emissions. We were pleased to find that all officers on the working group were also members of the Council's Carbon Management Action Plan Group.
- 2.20 Current initiatives being undertaken, which we discussed at our meeting, that included, but were not limited to energy emissions, are:-
- Monitoring and targeting - the opportunity to monitor half hourly electrical use in eight of the Council's highest energy using buildings and the intention to add another ten buildings to this list.
  - Building Controls - a significant number of the Council's buildings have programmable controllers to manage the heating systems. Based on best practice and the agreed winter heating policy, CAFM are arranging for the re-programming all of these controllers to provide optimum operating

conditions. The controllers will be fixed and any heating issues dealt with via the CAFM service desk.

- Other 'no cost' measures – CAFM have a number of 'no cost' energy saving ideas that are currently under review with Area Facilities Officers with a view to implementing as soon as possible.
- Invest to Save - There are many ways to save energy through modest levels of capital investment and alternative financing models. CAFM intended to develop energy efficiency programs using the baseline data from the 10:10 Aecom audits (audit standards); and the technical expertise of the CAFM team. Initiatives such as improved insulation, lighting controls, voltage optimisation, Building Energy Management Systems (BEMS) PC power down, LED lighting and waterless urinals were being considered.
- Capital Projects - Working with Corporate Projects, CAFM is supporting the design teams for the new library and the Princess Building refurbishment in maximising building energy efficiency as far as possible.
- Renewable Energy Technologies – CAFM is in its infancy and is focusing initially on low cost 'best practice' energy efficiency measures rather than renewable energy technologies. However, the Council policy requiring BREEAM ratings has already resulted in ground source heat pumps and photovoltaic panels being proposed for the new central library.
- Asset Review Programme - The CAFM's Transformation Programme aims to ensure that Calderdale Council's land and property assets are fit for purpose, deliver value for money and support and enhance delivery service. This has resulted in a systematic review of the estate which will lead to optimising the use of our buildings. This will inevitably result in a reduction of the size of the current estate (359 buildings and parcels of land as of April 2013) and the resulting energy usage.

2.21 In addition to the above, we found that other initiatives under consideration included:- supporting the re-launch of "Green Champions" as a means of improving employee behaviour regarding energy use; creating benchmark standards and building efficiency measures; and producing an energy policy for the Council.

2.22 We also asked the officers' about the long term strategy. In response, reference was made to longer term planning (starting April, 2014) and the intention that the overall strategy was to deliver as much as we could in the short term using all resources available in the Council. (CAFM recognises that additional savings can be made across the Council through 'invest to save' projects). We found that CAFM intend to appoint a 'specialist' service provider to work with the Council on a commercially beneficial basis from 1st April 2014. CAFM may adopt a 'shared savings' approach where payment is based on a proportion of the savings achieved rather than a fee. A prioritised plan will be implemented throughout the year. CAFM intend to start to procure these services shortly so that the contract can start on the 1 April 2014.

- 2.23 We asked several questions of our CAFM colleagues, included what had been learnt from best practice elsewhere, particularly in implementing “no-cost” measures; purchasing and existing contracts; capital projects such as the new library (managed by Corporate Projects team) and the Piece Hall Restoration Project; the relationships with the SMARTER working programme; the use of energy consumption league tables and the wider green economy (such as waste management arrangements). The increasing tariffs and costs for the Council’s energy bills and how this could be best managed were also discussed.
- 2.24 In addition, we raised the potential of using the school's capital works budget for energy efficiency improvements; on how staff could be incentivised to be more “green” in the work place; the number of buildings to be monitored; and the potential/opportunities for using local green businesses for the provision of equipment.
- 2.25 We also received position statements on what energy efficiency measures and plans have been put in place for the new Library and for the Piece Hall restoration.
- 2.26 New central library and archive - energy efficiency – we found that although on site renewable generation is very challenging, we were pleased to hear that the opportunity has been taken to use part of the Piece Hall courtyard so that ground source heat pumps can be incorporated in to the design. In addition, we were informed of the following energy efficient elements proposed to be featured in the new building: Reduction of CO2 emissions (from energy usage) dependant on various factors; High levels of insulation; Natural ventilation; Photo-voltaic panels on the roof; Ground source heat pumps for heating and cooling; Thermal mass of the construction to stabilise heat; Energy efficient lighting - LED light bulbs and Passive Infrared sensors (PIRs); triple glazing rather than double glazing; draft lobby – to minimise heat loss and air tightness – to minimise heat loss
- 2.27 Piece Hall Transformation Project - Environmental Efficiencies – we were informed that the two key issues to be addressed in reducing CO2 emissions, within the financial and aesthetic constraints of the project, were to minimize the need for energy and to provide energy required in an efficient and sustainable manner. Environmentally efficient environmental systems and equipment would be installed including low water-consumption fittings.

**Recommendation 2**

**That the Portfolio Holder and the Director, Economy and Environment be informed that we endorse the concept of invest to save initiatives (such as outlined in paragraphs 2.20 and 2.26 of this report) and would like to see this area of work further developed, including the exploration of possible other sources of funding for invest to save initiatives, such as the green investment bank.**

### **Recommendation 3**

**That the Portfolio Holder and the Director, Economy and Environment be requested to give their full support to taking forward the proposed initiatives (as outlined at Para. 2.21 above) for the relaunching of “Green Champions” as a means of improving employee behaviour regarding energy use; creating benchmark standards and building efficiency measures; and producing an energy policy for the Council.**

### **Recommendation 4**

**That the Portfolio Holder and the Director, Economy and Environment be requested to explore further the potential of using the school’s capital works budget (as outlined in Para 2.24 above) for energy efficiency improvements (assuming deficiencies within the basic need criteria of schools have been addressed first); on how staff could be incentivised to become more “green” in the work place; the number of buildings to be monitored; and the potential/opportunities for using local businesses involved in “green” industries for the provision of equipment.**

### **Community Energy Generation Schemes**

- 2.28 Helen Rhodes, Private Sector Housing Manager Emma Appleton, Carbon Partnerships Officer, Economy and Environment Directorate and Finn Jensen, from Pennine Community Power joined us at our 18 November 2013 meeting
- 2.29 We learnt about a desktop feasibility study (which had been undertaken at no cost to the Council) which outlined an assessment of wind energy potential within the Calderdale Metropolitan Borough.<sup>1</sup> The study had been undertaken in response to the Council’s desire to understand the wind energy potential within the Borough, to evaluate this potential and map out locations which may be suitable for wind energy development. The assessment conducted looked at the potential for small, medium and large wind developments.
- 2.30 We agreed that there was a need for the “aesthetic” placing of wind turbines in any site layout; that local residents’ feedback and the location of turbines are extremely important factors that should be taken into consideration. This was backed up by Finn Jenson, Pennine Community Power, who talked from his own personal experiences, and added that opinions tended to be divided in communities about wind farms. It was important to consult and communicate with local communities, particularly if it is intended that the turbines should be locally owned / invested in.

---

<sup>1</sup> Calderdale Wind Energy Assessment, Assessment of wind energy potential within Calderdale Metropolitan Borough – desktop feasibility study undertaken by Ogden Renewable Energy (“or energy”)

- 2.31 It is important to work with local landowners in identifying potential future sites for turbines, as with local planning and neighbourhood planning. The Council should consider the value of developing a “wind energy strategy” to help communities wanting to investigate and develop potential sites.
- 2.32 The following discussion documents were also considered by us in our research in this matter:-
- ❖ *Discussion document – Wind Energy, the Wider Programme – report of Rochdale MBC dated 31<sup>st</sup> October, 2013;*
  - ❖ *Discussion document – The Community Renewables Economy (starting up, scaling up and spinning out), ResPublica, September, 2013;*
  - ❖ *Discussion document – An introduction to Community Energy – Case Studies – from the Alternative Technology Centre – Community Energy.*
- 2.33 We found that local authorities are in a strong position to implement positive, enabling policies that can support the development of community renewable energy projects. The need to ensure that local authorities have sufficient knowledge about the importance of renewable energy was emphasised, so that they can make fully informed decisions.
- 2.34 We felt that the use of joint ownership approaches in which communities work with renewable energy project developers and local businesses and local authorities towards a common goal could be beneficial. Also, developing and improving relationships with Council planning departments and other local authority departments (e.g. legal and communities) – the need for more streamlined communications and joined up thinking on renewable energy projects was identified as a key factor.
- 2.35 Localism Act 2011 – new rights for Councils to borrow and invest - local authorities are now well placed to begin to both invest and financially benefit from community energy projects.
- 2.36 Learning from best practice from the existing good energy mix already in Calderdale (Biomass boilers, hydro power etc) was seen as another positive way forward.
- 2.37 ResPublica identified central barriers to growth of community energy, a lack of guidance and access to data and community energy projects often failed simply because they have not been sufficiently informed or advised as to the requirements of the planning process. Even those with a good grasp of the planning process could be hindered by a lack of access to crucial data to determine project viability. We found that research has shown that guidance at local level, particularly at the level of local authority, does have a strong impact on project success.

2.38 We felt that the Council should look to develop a “General Energy Policy” and community energy portal on its website. The Private Sector Housing Manager told us that there was a proposal to take a paper to Cabinet on the possible future development of a Council Community Energy Company. We felt that it would be beneficial for such a report to be first considered by the Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel. We were pleased that this subsequently happened at the Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel meeting held in January 2014. The Panel generally endorsed the creation of the Calderdale Community Energy Company as it has the potential to generate considerable income into the Borough that would directly enhance the well being of local residents and increase energy resilience, but with a number of reservations, including the set-up costs, recognising there are risks involved in setting up the proposed company, long term sustainability and governance arrangements.

**Recommendation 5**

**That the Portfolio Holder and Director, Economy and Environment take into account the importance of consulting and communicating with the local community, particularly if the intention is for the turbine(s) to be locally owned / invested in.**

**Recommendation 6**

**That the Portfolio Holder and Director, Economy and Environment be informed that the Council should consider developing a general energy policy which brings together the key elements of energy work being undertaken by the Council, such as Energy Futures work; Invest to Save; improving energy efficiency awareness/measures amongst Council staff; and progressing the establishment of the Calderdale Community Energy company, including for the development of a community energy portal on the Council website.**

**Recommendation 7**

**That the Director, Economy and Environment be informed that there is a need for more streamlined communications and joined-up thinking on renewable energy projects and improved relationships between the Council’s planning department and other departments within the local Authority, such as legal services and the communities and Business change directorate**

## **Biodiversity**

- 2.39 In January 2014 we met with Hugh Firman, the Council's Conservation Officer. He provided us with some very useful background information and case studies on biodiversity in Calderdale.
- 2.40 We were made aware of the legislation that exists around biodiversity, in particular s40 of the Natural Environment and Rural Communities Act 2006 - the duty to conserve biodiversity:- *“Every public authority must, in exercising its functions, have regard, so far as is consistent with the proper exercise of those functions, to the purpose of **conserving** biodiversity”*. **Conserving** biodiversity includes, in relation to a living organism or type of habitat, restoring or enhancing a population or habitat”.
- 2.41 We talked about the guidance for Local Authorities on implementing the biodiversity duty and what that meant for Calderdale Council, especially through land and building management; planning and development; education, advice and awareness; and surveys, records (West Yorkshire Ecology).
- 2.42 The importance of biodiversity - climate change mitigation; economic; quality of life; sustaining life; cultural identity; products; community engagement and responsibilities were also outlined.
- 2.43 Planning and the National Planning Policy Framework: bats; turbines; uplands, grasslands and woodlands management were also brought to our attention.
- 2.44 We also asked the Council's Tourism Officers' about the current levels of eco-tourism and eco-accommodation available in Calderdale. In response, we found that there were two accommodations in Calderdale which have incorporated renewable energy into their build beyond the addition of a few solar/photovoltaic (pv) panels on their roofs, both located at Cragg Vale.
- 2.45 In addition, we found that whilst not offering accommodation, 'Gibson Mill' at Hardcastle Crags exists completely off-grid with solar/pv and hydro electric power as well as a wood/pellet burner in its café.
- 2.46 We found that currently the Council does not facilitate “eco-tourism” marketing via Visitcalderdale.com as it is not a phrase that can be used in searches or browses in NVG's Destination Management System (DMS) that drives browse and search functionality on our website.
- 2.47 However, as more and more people grow interested in eco-tourism, which they undoubtedly will, we believe it should be incorporated it into search and browse functionality.
- 2.48 More locally and individual to Calderdale – Hebden Bridge is considered a flag ship in terms of eco friendly businesses and status and promotes itself as such. Incredible Edible Todmorden is also a proven tourism driver.

2.49 We asked Mr Firman what he felt was the biggest threat to biodiversity in Calderdale at the present time, to which he responded “a lack of and poor management of sites”. We also asked him if there was one thing that could be done to improve biodiversity in Calderdale, what would it be? He would like to see all wildlife sites in Calderdale (both in public and private ownership) brought into good condition.

#### **Recommendation 8**

**That the Council should make the best use of powers in the Sustainable Communities Act to support Biodiversity in Calderdale; and actively work with public bodies such as Pennine Prospects and Local Nature Partnerships and Natural England which plays a crucial role in protecting and improving England’s natural environment and encouraging people to enjoy and get involved in their surroundings.**

#### **Affordable Warmth**

2.50 We also met with Richard Armitage, Housing Projects Manager, Economy and Environment Directorate along with Kayleigh Loffhagen, SWYP NHS Foundation Trust, Health Improvement Practitioner and Chair of the Affordable Warmth Partnership at our January 2014 meeting.

2.51 The Head of Housing, Environment and Renewal had provided us with an affordable warmth update; along with a copy of the Cabinet report, 8<sup>th</sup> May, 2013, report of the Director of Economy and Environment on the Home Energy Conservation Act (HECA) 1995 – Delivery Plan 2013-15.

2.52 We were updated on key points, developments, initiatives, future plans and challenges including:- some background context on excess winter deaths and fuel poverty; an overview: key housing and affordable warmth projects and their outputs; a more detailed look at affordable warmth work being done with Social Care; an update from the Calderdale Affordable Warmth Partnership (CAWP) and work being done by health colleagues; the Green Deal and ECO procurement with Leeds City Region; and looking at some of the key challenges over the next 12 months.

2.53 Kayleigh Loffhagen informed us that as well as being the Chair of the Calderdale Affordable Warmth Partnership, she worked as a Health Improvement Practitioner for the SWYP NHS Foundation Trust, who had commissioned her to work on affordable warmth in Calderdale. She talked about the on-going initiatives, challenges and future plans of the Foundation Trust and Calderdale Affordable Warmth Partnership and also drew our attention to a leaflet on “Making Every Contact Count (MECC) – Healthy Chats training” that she delivered as part of her role with the SWYPFT. It was delivered as free training in Calderdale (available until the end of March 2014) and it was explained that the Healthy Chats training would enable those who undertook the course to:-



- Increase or refresh their **knowledge** of public health issues in Calderdale
- Increase **understanding** of their role in public health;
- Increase their **confidence** to address health and lifestyle issues through conversations with clients, customers and members of the public;
- Increase their **skills** and **knowledge** around how to begin, direct and end a healthy chat; and
- Increase **referrals** into lifestyle support services to help people access the specialist support to help them succeed.

2.54 Other matters we raised and discussed included:- procurement; Leeds City Region and Green Deal; remote area residences and what potential there was for any cheaper alternatives to oil fired power in such properties?; impartial advice provided by the Department to enquiries on options available; the role of social housing landlords, for instance, we found that Pennine Housing has its own energy efficiency team; the availability and access to budgeting advice for tenants; and economic impact of tackling fuel poverty and opportunities for green businesses to develop.

2.55 We asked Mr Armitage what he felt could help more in the future. In response, he felt that “the need to drive demand for individuals / businesses to become more “green” through awareness raising” is important.



Figure 1; Evidence gathering session, Halifax Town Hall.

### **3. OUR REVIEW WORK – EVIDENCE GATHERING “DROP-IN” SESSIONS**

#### **“Witness Evidence” gathering events – drop-in sessions, Halifax Town Hall**

- 3.1 We held two “drop-in” evidence gathering events at Halifax Town Hall (December 2013 and January 2014) which afforded businesses and social and community enterprises in Calderdale involved in the green economy the opportunity to let us know their views.
- 3.2 We also conducted telephone interviews with a number of businesses on the Council’s green economy database of businesses to gauge their views.
- 3.3 At our first drop-in session, we heard from a director of a local estate agency, whose firm for several years had run a small fleet of Smart Cars. More recently, the firm had purchased a Renault Twizy, which was the company’s first electric car. The main concern raised was the small number of charging points in the Borough, and a hope that in the future there could be a network of (preferably rapid charging points) throughout the Borough.
- 3.4 Other contributors at our first session included partners in a new start-up green business based in Park Ward and the work they were undertaking with the community, groups, and places of faith on green initiatives. They also have an education training arm they are developing and wish to work more closely with schools.
- 3.5 Another contributor, an electrical wholesaler and retail specialist, talked to us about the potential (green) savings that could be made by applying the latest solutions for lighting. The company was also in the process of signing up to the Council’s Green pledge and they hoped to join the Carbon Club. We discussed energy efficient solutions, such as “Induction” lighting, which, although currently expensive to install, had long term benefits in the use of less electricity.
- 3.6 A further contributor told us about his business, which was all about getting business people to work some of their time from home or not from the office. To enable this, the company would be invited to alter clients computing and telephony or supply cloud based office systems and cloud based telephone systems. The company’s aim was to get people off the roads at least part of the week. Locally, the contributor stated that to allow this to happen, his company would like to see Calderdale MBC take the initiative by taking over the local telecommunications infrastructure, and using the excess in revenue to fund a broadband revolution so all homes and businesses within Calderdale have 100 Mb/s download speed and at least 50 Mb/s upload speed.
- 3.7 We also received a written submission from an eco-heat and power business, which raised points about planning rules; community generation schemes and the Council’s procurement policies and practices. We agreed, that where possible under planning laws, planning policies should take into account the potential of renewable energy in new developments (eg properties built with south facing roofs which would be beneficial for the installation of solar panels)

- 3.8 A number of the contributors also raised the issue of parking and parking charges in Calderdale, such as incentivising the use of electric vehicles by the Council applying exemptions and not charging for such vehicles in our car parks.

**Recommendation 9**

**That Cabinet is asked to investigate the possibility of applying exemptions and not charging parking fees for electric cars at some of Calderdale Council's car parks**

- 3.9 At our second drop-in session in January 2014, we received a detailed and informative presentation from the clerk of Hebden Royd Town Council on energy efficiency measures/plans being undertaken at Hebden Bridge Picture House particularly in relation to the auditorium lighting.
- 3.10 We found that the greatest challenges/barriers the Town Council faced in going "green" in respect of the Picture House was that everything tended to be very time consuming and the capital needed to invest in projects.
- 3.11 We also received a written submission (via the notes of a telephone interview) from Mr Nick O'Connor, Head of Greendale Homes, which was the new energy efficient division of Southdale Homes. We found out about the work they had been undertaking on a pilot eco-scheme in Park Ward; their concerns about major changes to the Energy Company Obligation (ECO) schemes recently announced by the chancellor, which they stated would result in the company now only being able to deliver the comprehensive treatment of homes in Park Ward until April 2014, instead of April 2015, as originally planned. The energy companies now have to reassess which measures they will be able to fund under the new criteria. This means many fewer homes being treated than had been anticipated.
- 3.12 We also heard that they had approached both local MPs to ask that their concerns about the possible impact of these changes to the ECO scheme on households in Calderdale should be put forward to the ECO consultation which will be taking place early in 2014. Post meeting, we also found that the Leader of Leeds City Council; the Chairs of the Leeds City Region (LCR) Leaders Board, Local Enterprise Partnership and Green Economy Panel; and the Mayor of Bristol, George Ferguson, CBE on behalf of the Core Cities Cabinet had all written to the Secretary of State for Energy and Climate Change and expressed their concerns about the potential impact of changes to ECO. We urge the Leader of Calderdale Council to do the same.

## Recommendation 10

**That the Portfolio Holder and the Director, Economy and Environment be requested to look at the feasibility of producing a Directory of Businesses for businesses involved in green industries (hard copy and/or web based) for Calderdale.**



**Figure 2 – Renault Twizy – Electric car**

## Appendix 1

### WHAT EXTRA WE CAN DO? – OUR RECOMMENDATIONS

<b>Recommendation 1</b>	That the Portfolio Holder and the Director, Economy and Environment are requested to place a greater emphasis on championing the Green Economy as a key sector within the Leeds City Region (LCR); in supporting the on-going and pipeline projects for Calderdale in the LCR; and to enable sufficient Council staff and resource to be committed to ensure Calderdale can play a full and active role in engaging with and benefiting from this green economy sector work.
<b>Recommendation 2</b>	That the Portfolio Holder and the Director, Economy and Environment be informed that we endorse the concept of “Invest to save” initiatives (such as outlined in paragraphs 2.20 and 2.26 of this report) and would like to see this area of work further developed, including the exploration of possible other sources of funding for invest to save initiatives, such as the Green Investment bank.
<b>Recommendation 3</b>	That the Portfolio Holder and the Director, Economy and Environment be requested to give their full support to take forward the proposed initiatives (as outlined in Para. 2.21 above) for the re-launching of “Green Champions” as a means of improving employee behaviour regarding energy use; creating benchmark standards and building efficiency measures; and producing an energy policy for the Council.
<b>Recommendation 4</b>	That the Portfolio Holder and the Director, Economy and Environment be requested to explore further the potential of using the school’s capital works budget (as outlined in Para. 2.24 above) for energy efficiency improvements (assuming deficiencies within the basic need criteria of schools have been addressed first); on how staff could be “incentivised” to become more green in the workplace; the number of buildings to be monitored; and the potential / opportunities

	for using local businesses involved in “green industries” for the provision of equipment.
<b>Recommendation 5</b>	That the Portfolio Holder and Director, Economy and Environment take into account the importance of consulting and communicating with the local community, particularly if the intention was for the turbine(s) to be locally owned / invested in.
<b>Recommendation 6</b>	That the Portfolio Holder and Director, Economy and Environment be informed that the Council should consider developing a general energy policy which brings together the key elements of energy work being undertaken by the Council, such as Energy Futures work, Invest to save; and improving energy efficiency awareness/measures amongst staff; progressing the establishment of the Calderdale Community Energy company, including for the development of a community energy portal on the Council website.
<b>Recommendation 7</b>	That the Director, Economy and Environment be informed that there is a need for more streamlined communications and joined-up thinking on renewable energy projects and improved relationships between the Council’s planning department and other departments within the local authority, such as legal services and the Communities and Business Change Directorate.
<b>Recommendation 8</b>	That the Council should make the best use of powers in the Sustainable Communities Act to support biodiversity in Calderdale; and actively work with public bodies such as Pennine Prospects and Local Nature Partnerships and Natural England, which plays a crucial role in protecting and improving England’s natural environment and encouraging people to enjoy and get involved in their surroundings.

<b>Recommendation 9</b>	<b>That Cabinet is asked to investigate the possibility of applying exemptions and not charging parking fees for electric cars at some of Calderdale Council's car parks.</b>
<b>Recommendation 10</b>	<b>That the Portfolio Holder and Director, Economy and Environment be requested to look at the feasibility of producing a directory of businesses involved in green industries (hard copy and/or web based) for Calderdale.</b>

## Appendix 2

### **Membership of the Detailed Scrutiny Review**

Councillor J Baker (Co-Chair)  
Councillor J Lynn (Co-Chair)  
Councillor J Battye  
Councillor R Taylor  
Councillor D Young

### **Membership of the Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel (2013/14)**

Councillor S Benton (Chair)  
Councillor F Ali  
Councillor J Baker  
Councillor P Caffrey  
Councillor J Lynn  
Councillor R Marshall  
Councillor S Young (until November, 2013)  
Councillor A Wilkinson (from November, 2013)

*(Support to this Scrutiny Review Group was provided by Paul Preston, Scrutiny Support Officer, Democratic and Partnership Services)*



### Summary of Witnesses Giving Evidence

Andrew Sharpe, Lead for Commercial and Contract Management, Corporate Asset and Facilities Management (CAFM)

Robert Baylis, Environmental, Quality and Compliance (EQC) Manager Corporate Asset and Facilities Management (CAFM)

Helen Rhodes, Private Sector Housing Manager, Economy and Environment Directorate

Kate Bisson, Sustainability Officer, Economy and Environment Directorate

Emma Appleton, Carbon Partnerships Officer, Economy and Environment Directorate

Hugh Firman, Conservation Officer, Countryside service, Safer, Cleaner and Greener, Communities and Business Change Directorate

Richard Armitage, Housing Projects Manager, Economy and Environment Directorate

Kayleigh Loffhagen, SWYP NHS Foundation Trust, Health Improvement Practitioner and Chair of the Calderdale Affordable Warmth Partnership

Finn Jenson, Pennine Community Power

Jason Boom, Town Clerk, Hebden Royd Town Council

Nick O'Connor, Head of Greendale Homes (the energy efficient division of Southdale Homes) (telephone interview / notes)

Andrew Hodchild, Eco-heat and power (telephone interview / notes)

Melanie Taylor, Green Economy Lead, Leeds City Region secretariat

Noel Wood – Director, Peter David Properties Limited

Steven Barratt, Co-Managing Director, Portel AV Limited

Amanda Speight, Business Development Manager, JG Harrisons & sons Ltd

Mr Z Khalil and Mr S Hussain – Green Zone Energy

## Appendix 4

### References and Bibliography

Notes of all meetings of the Green Economy detailed scrutiny review - held by the Scrutiny Support Team, Room 10, Halifax Town Hall

Calderdale Energy Future – Launch Conference programme – October, 2013

Leeds City Region (LCR) – Green Economy lead – power point presentation – what happening in the LCR and elsewhere? (October, 2013)

Calderdale Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel report and extract of minute – Calderdale Energy Future and Green Economy Update - September, 2013

Calderdale Council - written update provided by Economy and Environment Directorate on work with Leeds City Region Green Economy Projects – October, 2013.

Calderdale Council - written update provided by Economy and Environment Directorate on Leeds City Region pipeline projects (October, 2013)

Position statement - provided by Corporate Assets and Facilities Management (CAFM) team – update on CAFM management activities (October, 2013)

Calderdale Wind Energy Assessment, Assessment of wind energy potential within Calderdale Metropolitan Borough – desktop feasibility study undertaken by Ogden Renewable Energy (“or energy”) (October, 2013)

Community Energy Generation Schemes – discussion documents:-

- Wind Energy, the Wider Programme – report of Rochdale MBC dated 31<sup>st</sup> October, 2013;
- the Community Renewables Economy (*starting up, scaling up and spinning out*), ResPublica, September, 2013;
- An introduction to Community Energy – Case Studies – from the Alternative Technology Centre – Community Energy.

West Yorkshire Zoom – details of initial bid outlines for rapid charge points

Calderdale Green Business Database – October, 2013

Written submission (evidence gathering drop-in session) – Barrett, Portel AV limited

Written submission (evidence gathering drop-in session) – A Speight, JG Harrison and Sons Ltd (Electrical)

Written submission (evidence gathering drop-in session (via telephone interview)) - Andrew Hodchild, Eco-heat and power

Written submission (evidence gathering drop-in session (via telephone interview)) - Nick O'Connor, Head of Greendale Homes

Powerpoint presentation – Hugh Firman, Conservation Officer, Countryside service, Safer, Cleaner and Greener, Communities and Business Change Directorate

Cabinet report (May, 2013) – Home Energy Conservation Act (HECA) 1995 – Delivery Plan 2013-15 – report of the Director of Economy and Environment

Any enquiries or requests for background information,  
please contact Paul Preston, Democratic and Partnership  
Services, Calderdale Council, Halifax Town Hall, Halifax,  
HX1 1UJ

Tel: (01422) 393250

Email: [scrutiny@calderdale.gov.uk](mailto:scrutiny@calderdale.gov.uk)  
<http://www.calderdale.gov.uk>