



**A SCRUTINY REVIEW OF THE
RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE LOCAL
ENVIRONMENT AND PUBLIC HEALTH IN
CALDERDALE**



**FINAL REPORT OF THE ECONOMY & ENVIRONMENT
SCRUTINY PANEL**

APRIL, 2015

Contents

<u>Section</u>	<u>Page</u>
Chair's foreword	3
Introduction	4
Background and evidence sources	5
Research and findings	6
Evidence gathering "key stakeholder" sessions	16
What extra we can do - our recommendations (Appendix 1)	22
Acknowledgements (Appendices 2-4)	24
Glossary of Terms (Appendix 5)	28

FOREWORD

Councillor James Baker

In the autumn of 2014, Calderdale Council's Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel decided to appoint a cross-party review group to look at the relationships between the local environment and public health.

We held our first review group meeting in November 2014 and agreed our methodology and ways of working. During the course of our review, we have looked closely at how the Council and its partners work on local environment and public health activities and initiatives, primarily within Calderdale, but also looking at examples of best practice regionally and nationally.

The scrutiny review group focussed on exploring the relationships between the local environment and public health to see if by making our environment a healthier place to live we can improve people's health.

We identified three key objectives for us to focus on through our review group work: developing policies that promote active and sustainable travel across the borough; developing policies that reduce the negative effects of living in cold homes upon public health and developing policies that seek to mitigate the public health effects of environmental pollution.

In addition, we also held a "key stakeholders" evidence gathering event at Halifax Town Hall on 25 February 2015 when we were pleased to receive contributions from the portfolio holder for economy, the member champion for public health, and the Chair of the Council's Health and Well-Being Board, along with key Council officers as well.

We are pleased to present this report of the Local Environment and Public Health Detailed Scrutiny Review Group.

Councillor James Baker,



Chair, Local Environment and Public Health detailed scrutiny review
Chair, Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel

INTRODUCTION

In September 2014, the Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel decided to undertake a scrutiny review on the local environment and public health and, requested the Chair, Councillor Baker to develop more detailed terms of reference for the review, and to provide an update for the next meeting of this Panel.

Draft Term of Reference were subsequently approved by the Scrutiny Panel in October 2014 and this time-limited (task and finish) review group was set up to take a more detailed look at local environment and public health activities and initiatives being undertaken in Calderdale.

There was very keen interest from many other Members of the Council to become involved in this review work and the Panel appointed Councillor J Baker (to chair the review group), along with Councillors M James, R Marshall, MBE, S Press and J Smith-Moorhouse.

We issued a number of press releases publicising the review group's work, which generated local press coverage including in the Hebden Bridge Times and the Todmorden News, together with local radio coverage, with the Chair being interviewed about and discussing the review group's work on Radio Phoenix, the community radio station for Calderdale.

This report, which sets out our findings from our scrutiny review on the local environment and public health, also makes a number of recommendations to the Cabinet Member, Economy and Environment, the Director Economy and Environment and other bodies as appropriate.

I would like to thank all members of the detailed review group for their time, energy and contributions in undertaking this review. A big *thank you* as well to Officers' in the Council, particularly the Director of Public Health and colleagues in the Economy and Environment and Communities and Service Directorates, for both their "expert witness" evidence at review group meetings they attended and for providing so much of the background information.

BACKGROUND

1.1 Working Party objectives

The Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel agreed to establish a detailed scrutiny review group during the 2014/15 municipal year. The review work began in November 2014, when the terms of reference for the review had been agreed and focused on:-

- developing policies that promoted active and sustainable travel across the Borough;
- developing policies that would reduce the negative effects of living in cold homes upon public health;
- developing policies that sought to mitigate the public health effects of environmental pollution.

1.2 Membership

The membership of the detailed scrutiny review group was Councillors J Baker (Chair), M James, R Marshall, MBE, S Press and J Smith-Moorhouse

1.3 Background and Evidence Sources

This scrutiny review was established by the Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel.

During the course of our review, we received a considerable amount of background information and evidence from the Director of Public Health, officers from the Communities and Service and Economy and Environment Directorates, along with further contributions from other Councillors, portfolio holders, the Member Champion for Public Health along with our Scrutiny Support Team.

We also considered a number of pieces of external evidence, including a presentation by Sally Jones, the West Yorkshire Low Emission Strategy Manager (Air Quality) at one of our meetings.

2. OUR REVIEW WORK – OUR RESEARCH AND FINDINGS

Developing policies that promote active and sustainable travel across the Borough (meeting held 10 December, 2014)

- 2.1 We focused at our 10 December 2014 meeting on the first of our three key objectives in undertaking this review as we had identified in our terms of reference: *developing policies that promote active and sustainable travel across the Borough*.
- 2.2 Paul Butcher, the Director of Public Health provided us with a “scene setting” background/discussion document. We were also joined at the meeting by colleagues from the Council’s Economy and Environment Directorate who updated us on the work the environmental management team was undertaking to promote active and sustainable travel across the Borough.
- 2.3 From a public health perspective, we first looked at the types of activities and targets which could help promote active and sustainable travel across the Borough.
- 2.4 These included the need to set ambitious targets for a growth in cycling and walking, and to ensure they are met; to invest at a realistic level – where possible, aiming to commit 10% of transport budgets to walking and cycling immediately, and in future ensure that transport funds are allocated proportionate to new and ambitious target levels; to create safe, attractive, walking and cycling conditions;
- 2.5 Also, to capitalise on 20mph implementation to develop community engagement in liveable streets and safer play areas; to tackle bad driving; to “health check” every transport and land use decision; and to develop an organisation-wide policy to encourage and support physical activity, for example reviewing data on staff travel patterns.
- 2.6 We also recognised the need to work with partners to achieve more active and sustainable travel throughout the Borough. For example we heard about cycling initiatives, involving national bodies such as “British Cycling”, the national bike charity “Sustrans”, Parliamentary work on cycling; a recent cycling conference hosted by Calderdale Council – building on the Tour de France (TdF) legacy; “Inner Cyclist” initiative; bikeability work and the potential better use of bridleways in the Borough – cycling and tourism.
- 2.7 In conjunction with the above, we received evidence from the Council’s Cycling Officer on cycling development in Calderdale, a report outlining a broad vision to cycling participation was also considered at this meeting.
- 2.8 In relation to cycling in Calderdale, by ways of informing the public regarding ways of safe cycling and leisure pursuits in the Borough, it was suggested at the meeting that a leaflet containing details, length etc. should be put together by Officers mapping National Cycle Network (NCN) Route 66, part of which ran through the Borough, perhaps dividing it into manageable lengths, and showing

access points, so that local people and tourists were aware of what Calderdale was offering in its endeavour to support cycling. It would be a good way forward to support healthy living, outdoor pursuits, and safe cycling and it was essential that the information was passed on to the public via Tourist Information, libraries, websites, etc.

- 2.9 The review group also learnt that a number of cycling routes have been introduced, including on and off road routes and information about these is available through the Visitor Information Centres. There would also be another promotional leaflet for National Cycle Network (NCN 66) which will be available in spring, 2015. Like the other leaflets this will indicate landmarks and refreshments stops – supporting cycle tourism. www.cyclecalderdale.co.uk continues to develop with new routes being added and a series of cycling events will also be added in the near future.
- 2.10 We also considered the positive impacts on health that could be achieved by people undertaking an additional 20 minutes more exercise per day – building active travel into everyday living.
- 2.11 In relation to the above, we discussed active travel plans for schools and links to exercise, for example walking and/or cycling rather than travelling by car.
- 2.12 We also recognised the importance of engaging with the local community and partners, such as the NHS on the development of active travel plans.
- 2.13 We learnt about work being undertaken on the canal towpaths on the Rochdale canal and the Calder and Hebble canal, including improvements works and connections with the cycle network across Calderdale, including National Cycle Route 66. This could be of benefit to those people wishing to cycle to work on the towpath as opposed to the main road.
- 2.14 In respect of improvement works to towpaths, we heard a suggestion about the possibility of launching a public subscription scheme to encourage local businesses and individuals to sponsor a few metres of towpath to help fund such towpath improvements. As a review group, we hope such a scheme may be developed and taken forward in Calderdale in the near future, as we recognise the importance of towpaths as cycle routes in the Borough, particularly in view of the general topography and hilly environment of our area.

Figure 1: Below - examples of canal towpath improvements at Hebden Bridge, Todmorden and at Mytholmroyd



Hebden Bridge towpath

Todmorden towpath

Mytholmroyd towpath

- 2.15 In addition, the review group received and gave consideration to a short power-point presentation by Councillor Baker who outlined some research he had undertaken on examples of “public sector architecture / public space” which promoted cycling.
- 2.16 In particular, he highlighted as an example, Dutch cycling infrastructure and what was noticeable in comparison to the United Kingdom (UK), was that Dutch cycle paths actually separated themselves out from the traffic, whereas UK cycle lanes tended to only be marked by a white line on the ground and didn't really act to separate the cyclist from the traffic. Pinch-points¹ were highlighted as a hazard to cyclists on our current road system.

Recommendation 1

That the Director of Communities and Service and the Director of Public Health, are requested to prepare a leaflet containing details, lengths etc. mapping National Cycle Route 66², perhaps dividing it into manageable lengths, and showing access points, so that local people and tourists are made aware of what Calderdale was offering in its endeavour to support cycling. This would be a good way forward to support healthy living, outdoor pursuits, and safe cycling and it is essential that the information is passed to the public via Tourist Information Centres, libraries and websites, etc.

Recommendation 2

That to help promote active and sustainable travel across the Borough, Cabinet be asked to consider setting aside a portion of the annual highways budget specifically for cycle path improvements³.

Developing policies that reduce the negative effects of living in cold homes upon public health (meeting held 6th January, 2015)

- 2.17 When we met on 6 January 2015, we focused on the second of our key objectives: developing policies that reduce the negative effects of living in cold homes upon public health
- 2.18 The Director of Public Health provided us with a “scene setting” document to aid our discussions. We were also joined at the meeting by Paul Butcher, Director of Public Health; Helen Rhodes, Sustainable Housing and Environment Manager; Richard Armitage, Housing Projects Manager; and Derek Shackleton, Principal Officer (Enforcement).

¹ reference www.cyclecityconnect.co.uk

² Following the review group's meeting in December, 2014, there has been significant developments on cycling funding with the announcement (March, 2015) of major investment into National Cycle network Route 66 through the Government's Cycle City ambition grant. This will allow large stretches of the canal towpath to be upgraded to facilitate cycling and walking for health.

³ The review group also noted that the Council has received some funding from the Canals and Rivers Trust for improvement works to towpaths to date.

- 2.19 The United Kingdom (UK) has one of the highest excess winter death rates in Europe with thousands of people dying prematurely every year because of excessive cold temperatures in their home during winter. Excess winter deaths are preventable and we noted that some other European countries saw far fewer deaths each year because their homes are more energy efficient.
- 2.20 In 2013, there were 94 excess winter deaths (EWD) in Calderdale, i.e. the number of additional deaths that occurred during the colder winter months of December to March, compared to the average number of deaths that occur during the rest of the year.
- 2.21 During 2013, there were approximately 2,500 excess winter deaths across the Yorkshire and Humber region. In comparison, there were 880 accidental deaths across the same area during the same year. Health data also suggested that there were 16% more deaths in the winter period compared with the average non-winter deaths. When compared to average regional and national data, the number of EWDs in Calderdale was not significantly different.
- 2.22 In 2012/13, there were 31,100 excess winter deaths in England and Wales. And conservative estimates from the World Health Organisation (WHO) indicated that around 30%⁴ of excess winter deaths could be attributed to cold indoor temperatures. Effectively this meant that around 9,330 people died in 2012/13 due to cold housing in the winter months.
- 2.23 In 2013, the Government introduced a new definition for measuring fuel poverty in England (the Low Income High Cost indicator), which found 2.4 million households to be *fuel poor* using the latest official statistics. Using the previous fuel poverty measure (the 10% indicator), the latest statistics indicated that there were 3 million households in fuel poverty in England.
- 2.24 We felt that the Council could make better use of statistical information such as that used above. It would help if the Council could employ one or two dedicated data analysts for this work. Whilst appreciating the Council already had an in-house Business Change and Performance Team, the review group felt that a dedicated data analyst resource would be beneficial to the Council in the long run in addressing fuel poverty / affordable warmth in particular and that Cabinet should consider this as a proposal on an “invest to save” basis. Further discussions around the principles of “open data”, sharing with partners and other organisations should also be explored and undertaken.
- 2.25 Fuel poverty and cold homes are health and wellbeing inequalities issues that require a cross-sector and multi-disciplinary approach, including strong leadership and action from all levels of the health system. It was suggested that we could look to collecting data from hospital admissions related to cold homes and that a rapid response team could then assess household needs.

⁴ The other 70% of EWDs according to the WHO were due to other factors such as exposure to the cold from being out and about i.e. strokes and heart failure, respiratory infections and underlying health conditions made worse by the cold.

Figure 2: working towards tackling fuel poverty and cold homes



2.26 In addition, we found that fuel-poor households are also more likely to live in energy inefficient homes across all tenures compared to non-fuel poor households. Private tenants are at the greatest risk of severe fuel poverty owing to having lower than average incomes compared to owner occupiers and living in the least energy efficient properties compared to social housing tenants.

2.27 We asked about the qualifying criteria for the Local Welfare Contingency fund and whether any discretion exists regarding regular, instead of one-off payments from the fund towards qualifying cases on the grounds of fuel poverty. We were informed by the Helen Rhodes, Sustainable Housing and Environment Manager, after consultation with Kerry Maynard, the Council's team leader, Revenue and Benefits, that at the moment there is no such discretion. However, we were further informed, and we hope this will be taken forward, that there is potential of some collaboration between these services and that they will explore this in preparation for delivering a comprehensive affordable warmth programme including access to debt advice and benefits maximisation as well as the energy and heating.

2.28 We found that the main interventions to tackle fuel poverty and cold homes spanned four main areas:

- Energy efficiency measures – increasing the energy efficiency of homes through loft and cavity insulation and efficient heating thereby improving thermal comfort and affordability of energy bills as well as future proofing homes against fuel poverty;
- Energy price support and switching – to ease the burden of high energy costs, for example through the Warm Home Discount, and to facilitate access to cheaper energy tariffs where possible;
- Providing advice and support that help people to overcome personal and structural barriers to keeping warm in their home such as problems with using heating controls; and

- Maximising income – enabling access to welfare benefits to which individuals and families are entitled, such as benefits and tax credits, and providing advice.

2.29 We also discussed the work of the South West Yorkshire Partnership NHS Foundation Trust which runs the Calderdale Health Improvement Resource Centre; the role General Practitioners (GPs) could play in flagging up and making referrals re potential issues of fuel poverty; preventative works and initiatives; availability of grants; benefits advice; and the better signposting the availability of “winter resource” services, such as the loaning out of temporary heaters.

2.30 Within the Council, we looked at the role the Council and partners, through the Health and Well-Being Board, undertake on the subject of fuel poverty and cold homes. We also considered health and wellbeing inequalities issues that require a cross-sector and multi-disciplinary approach, including strong leadership and action from all levels of the health system.

2.31 Attention was also drawn to the Calderdale Affordable Warmth Partnership (CAWP). Established some 12 years ago, the principal role of the CAWP is to co-ordinate activity amongst a range of partner agencies to ensure that help and assistance is targeted and provided for those households who are in the greatest need of assistance.

2.32 We discussed with the Principal Officer (Enforcement), Housing, Environment and Renewal the role his team could play in the above regard in helping to address the problems caused by cold homes and the legislative powers that are available to the Council.

2.33 Reference was also made to the powers available to the Council under the Housing Act 2004 such as the Housing, Health and Safety Rating System which provides local authorities with the opportunity to improve the thermal environment of dwellings of occupiers, e.g. loft insulation.

2.34 We also heard about Energy Performance Certificate (EPC) data sets that are available to the Council and were informed that enforcement powers for landlords who do not have the required Energy Performance Certificate for their properties have been transferred to the Council⁵. A project is planned for later in 2015 to target private rented properties without an EPC and provide help and advice to address this.

2.35 The Review Group was informed that the introduction of the Housing Health and Safety Rating System (HHSRS) by the Housing Act 2004 has provided local authorities with the opportunity to effect improvements to the thermal environment of dwellings for occupiers.

⁵ EPCs enforcement powers were previously undertaken by West Yorkshire Trading Standards, part of the West Yorkshire Joint Services

- 2.36 The review group also found that Environmental Health Officers (EHOs) could play an important role in bringing about thermal improvements to dwellings, particularly in the private rented sector. Although advice to occupiers and owners plays a significant part in their work, they also have enforcement powers. For example, EHOs have legal powers to enable them to require housing conditions to achieve the minimum standard prescribed by legislation.
- 2.37 However, we found that staff resources are limited which restricts the scope of provision available and means the service is predominantly reactive. An internal service review is currently being undertaken to ascertain if a limited amount of proactive work could be done to improve housing standards, which the review group hope will be undertaken.

Recommendation 3

That Cabinet be asked to give consideration to the establishment of one or two data analyst positions to work on a cross- council basis *(economic justification for establishment of posts – invest to save basis)*

(Whilst appreciating the Council already has an in-house Business Change and Performance Team, the review group felt that a dedicated data analyst resource would be beneficial to the Council in the long run in addressing fuel poverty / affordable warmth in particular and that Cabinet should consider this as a proposal on an “invest to save” basis. Further discussions around the principles of “open data”, sharing with partners and other organisations should also be explored and undertaken).

Recommendation 4

That the Portfolio Holder / Cabinet and the Director, Economy and Environment be requested to take note of and consider the evidential research previously undertaken by the National Institute of Environmental Health and the Building Research Establishment (BRE) which suggests that targeting the Borough’s worst housing with a £1.4m investment programme⁶ could save an estimated £4.65m in associated health care costs (and the increase in economic benefits such work would bring to the Borough).

⁶ Note: At the (Budget) Council meeting held on 23rd February, 2015, it was agreed that the Council would launch a £1.4 million affordable warmth scheme providing grants to improve heating and insulation to tackle cold homes, which had been linked to ill health and winter deaths

Developing policies that seek to mitigate the public health effects of environmental pollution (meeting held 20th January, 2015)

- 2.38 The Director of Public Health provided us with a “scene setting” background/discussion document to aid our deliberations in this matter, which outlined that from a public health perspective, a review of the effectiveness of existing air quality work was needed.
- 2.39 Public Health England in a report in the past year had also stated that some 93 deaths were attributed in Calderdale per year to air particulate pollution. These are across our area and not limited to the Air Quality Management Areas (AQMA) <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/estimating-local-mortality-burdens-associated-with-particulate-air-pollution>
- 2.40 The Council’s Air Quality Action Plan (AQAP) was written several years ago, and the review group expressed the strong view that there is now a pressing need for the AQAP to be revised and updated at the earliest opportunity.
- 2.41 The review group also welcomed the public health directorate investment of £95,000 to improve local air quality monitoring including a new investment to measure pm 2.5⁷ at Salterhebble.
- 2.42 We were informed that there is an initial requirement on councils to assess their areas to see if they are or are likely to exceed the Air Quality Objectives (AQOs), in which case areas were to be declared as Air Quality Management Areas (AQMAs) which was an ongoing process which was also subject to a three yearly review.
- 2.43 We found that Calderdale has declared seven air quality management areas (AQMAs):at Salterhebble, Sowerby Bridge, Hebden Bridge, Luddendenfoot, Stump Cross, Brighouse Town Centre and Hipperholme.
- 2.44 We also learned about proposals to reduce nitrogen dioxide levels in the Borough⁸. It is well documented that planting schemes help to reduce air pollution, however there needs to be due regard to the availability of land for such planting schemes to improve air quality and visual amenity. It was also mentioned that any development coming to planning should have planting schemes incorporated as part of the process. It was important that certain species of plants were used where possible, particularly those species that

⁷As a simple explanation PM_{2.5} means particulate matter not exceeding 2.5 micrometres in diameter. A micrometer is a millionth of a meter. For comparison a human hair is said to be about 90 micrometers in diameter. PM_{2.5} is small enough to get to the deepest part of the lungs where gaseous exchange takes place. Depending on whatever they are made of or are coated with they have the potential to impact on health. Bigger particles would tend to be exhaled, or be trapped in the mucus that lines the airways and in due course be ‘expelled’ from the body.

⁸ Nitrogen dioxide arises in the process of burning of fossil fuels in the presence of air, principally from vehicle emissions and fixed domestic and industrial combustion plant. In very simplistic terms it follows that energy efficiency and fuel economy and reducing amounts of fuel are measures which lead to less fuel being burned and therefore lead to lower emissions.

absorbed the most air pollution. Such a policy would be beneficial to our built environment.

- 2.45 Sustainable Urban Drainage Systems (SUDS) is important here as according to the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (DEFRA) an approach to managing rainwater falling on roofs and other surfaces is important to reduce the risk of flooding and water pollution, and to improve bio-diversity.
- 2.46 We also received evidence from Ryan Carroll, Senior Environmental Health Officer, with further contributions from Sally Jones, West Yorkshire Low Emissions Strategy (WYLES) manager and considered a technical background document entitled “Air Quality & Emissions, technical planning guidance”, part of the West Yorkshire Low Emissions Strategy.
- 2.47 Sally Jones also gave a detailed power-point presentation on the West Yorkshire Low Emissions Strategy. She highlighted the drivers for the WYLES, including health impact; legal requirement to meet air quality standards; risks of fines from EU Infraction proceedings; a regional approach rather than district level for WYLES; and the framework for future funding bids.
- 2.48 The WYLES is currently in draft form, with briefings on the document being held with each local authority members and stakeholders in Spring, 2015. Public consultation would then follow through Summer, 2015 with a view to formal adoption then being sought by each local authority / the West Yorkshire Combined Authority (WYCA) later in 2015.
- 2.49 The review group expressed concern at the high levels of pollutants that emissions from biomass boilers can produce and found that five schools in Calderdale now had biomass boilers (three fully installed, two awaiting commissioning).
- 2.50 In response to our concerns at the high levels of pollutants that emissions from biomass boilers produce, officers’ explained that biomass boilers were great at reducing carbon dioxide emissions^{9*} from fossil fuels and would safeguard the wider environment provided the pellets were sourced sustainably and that the technology was installed in suitable situations (which now tends to be the case for all renewable technologies).
- 2.51 We also found that the impact of biomass boilers on local air quality is also be affected by the following factors:
- The efficiency of the installation – how well does the boiler burn the biomass (lower efficiency = higher pollutants);
 - Proximity in or near areas of air quality concern (such as AQMAs);

⁹ * Biomass is a renewable fuel when harvested from sustainable plants as it will emit the same amount of carbon dioxide as is sequestered (set apart) by the plant in its growth.

- The technology the biomass boiler is replacing - oil / coal fired boilers (coal and oil emit significantly higher concentrations of PM₁₀ and NO_x than biomass).

2.52 Following our discussions on the WYLES around proposals for developing Low Emission Zones (LEZs)¹⁰, we felt that Cabinet should also consider undertaking a feasibility study into the possibility of introducing designated Low Emission Zones (LEZs) in Calderdale

Figure 3 below: the review group would welcome and support more direct enforcement work being undertaken by external partners of the Council, such as the Police, through the use of legally enforceable powers to tackle un-roadworthy vehicles with high emissions.



2.53 A Public Sector Executive e-newsletter article dated 8th December, 2014, sourced by the Chair, Councillor Baker entitled “Air Pollution now a public health crisis” highlighted a new report from MP’s that building new schools, hospitals and care homes next to air pollution hotspots should be made illegal to help reduce the tens of thousands of deaths caused by particulate pollution. The Environmental Audit Committee report argues air pollution is a ‘public health crisis’ causing nearly as many deaths as smoking and says that existing schools next to busy roads should also be fitted with air filtration systems.

Recommendation 5

That Cabinet’s agreement and support be sought for the early revision of the Calderdale Air Quality Action Plan (AQAP), which was written in 2009 and is in need of updating.

¹⁰ A Low Emission Zone (LEZ) is a defined area where access by certain polluting vehicles is restricted or deterred with the aim of improving the air quality.

Recommendation 6

That Cabinet’s agreement and support be sought to the undertaking and promotion of a targeted campaign of awareness of the on-going West Yorkshire Low Emissions Strategy (WYLES) work from a public health perspective, with the primary delivery method to be through low cost platforms such as social media (Facebook, Twitter etc.)

Recommendation 7

That Cabinet is asked to endorse and support more direct enforcement work being undertaken by external partners of the Council, such as the police, through the use of legally enforceable powers to tackle un-roadworthy vehicles with high emissions.

Recommendation 8

That Cabinet is asked to look into the possibility of undertaking a feasibility study into the possibility of introducing designated Low Emission Zones (LEZs) in Calderdale.

3. OUR REVIEW WORK – EVIDENCE GATHERING “KEY STAKEHOLDERS” SESSION

“Evidence Gathering” key stakeholder session – 25th February, 2015, Halifax Town Hall

- 3.1 We held an evidence gathering session for key stakeholders at Halifax Town Hall on Wednesday 25 February 2015 which afforded key stakeholders the opportunity to meet with the review group and let us know their views.
- 3.2 We heard from Councillor Miles, the recently appointed Member Champion for Public Health, Councillor Battye, Chair of the Council’s Health and Well-Being Board and Councillor Caffrey, the Cabinet Member for Economy.
- 3.3 Other contributions came from Paul Butcher, Director of Public Health and Richard Seaman, Development Manager, Economy and Environment Directorate. Submissions from Katie Kinsella, Principal Tourism Officer and Andy Geall, Cycling Officer were also considered by the Review Group

- 3.4 Councillor Miles welcomed the opportunity to meet with the review group and explained that she had only recently been appointed to the Member Champion role for Public Health in January 2015.
- 3.5 Councillor Miles felt it was important that all Members of the Council took the opportunity to learn about and promote public health activities etc. in their own wards, particularly those Councillors who also held positions as school governors, such as enquiring whether travel plans were recorded by the schools – how many pupils walked, cycled, came by bus, car etc.
- 3.6 She also talked about small measures that could be taken to help encourage people to undertake more walking and / or cycling activities, such as adding directional signs to footpath/cycle paths, and estimates of the time it takes to walk or cycle a particular route(s). In addition, she welcomed initiatives for Active Travel and the introduction of 20 mph zones within the Borough.
- 3.7 Councillor Peter Caffrey, the Council's Cabinet Member for Economy attended the session and commented on the three key objectives the review group were looking at in exploring the correlations between the local environment and public health and identify any gaps in provision with particular focus on: developing policies that promote active and sustainable travel across the borough; that reduced the negative effects of living in cold homes upon public health; and sought to mitigate the public health effects of environmental pollution.
- 3.8 Despite some recent reduction in fuel costs, he recognised that fuel poverty was a big concern for many residents in Calderdale. Residents need to be made more aware of matters such as home insulation and switching suppliers. There were also many hard to treat properties in Calderdale and he was not convinced that all major energy providers were meeting their obligations in this regard.
- 3.9 He commented on the recent Council budget decision that the Council would launch a £1.4 million affordable warmth scheme providing grants to improve heating and insulation to tackle cold homes, which had been linked to ill health and winter deaths. During the ensuing discussion, a suggestion was made that Cabinet should request a policy paper as soon as possible on how this £1.4m scheme was to be implemented and that the Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel could be used as "sounding board" on this important piece of policy development work. Links to Public Health, Calderdale and Huddersfield NHS Foundation Trust and Adults Health and Social Care, the Better Care Fund and the work of the Health and Well-Being Board would also needed to be considered in taking this work forward.
- 3.10 Councillor Caffrey also added the price of fuel was the major contributor to fuel poverty and that in his opinion, he believed fracking had the potential to significantly reduce fuel poverty.
- 3.11 Active Travel – Councillor Caffrey felt, being a cyclist himself, that provision for cyclists in Calderdale could be better. He mentioned the potential use of parks as locations for cycle routes. He also mentioned work with Sustrans, a leading

UK charity which aimed to enable people to travel by foot, bike or public transport for more of the journeys they make every day.

- 3.12 He also mentioned the recent bid for a Cycle City Ambition Grant 2 and the benefits of having good workplace provision to encourage employees to travel by bike rather than car. For example, the cost of a parking space annually generally costs more than providing employees with shower and changing facilities in the workplace.

Figure 4: secure cycling storage and workplace shower facilities would be welcomed



- 3.13 Environmental Pollution – reference was made to the on-going street lighting replacement work with new LED lights, which it is estimated will reduce energy use by 60%. Sub-regional work through the West Yorkshire Transport Fund and the need for a more “joined up” approach to future works through the Transport fund / Leeds City Region (LCR) work and the Local Plan were also highlighted.
- 3.14 Road congestion and queuing traffic were also a major source of additional emissions and he recognised that there are no easy solutions to address these matters. It is hoped that the introduction of the traffic management permit scheme may provide some alleviation of the congestion caused by street works which cause significant traffic build up. West Yorkshire Transport Fund projects include improvements to traffic flow through upgrading congested roads throughout West Yorkshire. The use of part time traffic control lights to reduce unnecessary idling at quiet times is also being considered.
- 3.15 Councillor Janet Battye, Chair of Calderdale Health and Well-Being Board addressed the review group.
- 3.16 The review group had identified the Calderdale Health and Well-Being Board as a key stakeholder in our work, particularly in relation to the key objectives we were focusing on, and on the subject of health and well-being inequalities which requires a cross-sector and multi-disciplinary approach, including strong leadership and action from all levels of the health system.
- 3.17 Councillor Battye began by outlining some of the Health and Wellbeing Board’s key functions and responsibilities, including preparing a Joint Services Needs Assessment (JSNA), an overall Calderdale Needs Assessment (CNA) and to prepare and lead on a Joint Wellbeing Strategy (JWS).
- 3.18 The Health and Well-Being board came into existence four years ago as a “shadow board” and had become a formal Board two years ago. Essentially a strategic planning board, meeting every two months, a senior Calderdale Councillor chairs the Board, with a Clinical Commissioning Group (CCG) member as Deputy Chair, with other membership included representatives from the Council, Police, Housing, voluntary sector and Healthwatch.

- 3.19 The Joint Services Needs Assessment (JSNA) is be refreshed every three years and requires considerable investment to keep it up-to-date. The JSNA, helps to identify trends and reports which assist the Health and Well-Being Board develop strategy.
- 3.20 Councillor Battye added that there are six big sets of outcomes that the Health and Well-Being Board is working on and they try to consider one set of outcomes at each Board meeting. Sub-Board delivery groups then do detailed work.
- 3.21 Councillor Battye also flagged up the recent work of the People’s Commission, on which she had served as a member. The Commission has recently published its report and a number of recommendations, the Health and Well-Being Board will be looking at some of these recommendations at future meetings and considering how they could best be addressed, particularly where more cross-sector working is required and how things fitted in with the Health and Well-Being strategy.
- 3.22 Richard Seaman, the Council’s Development Manager, Planning and Highways also gave evidence to the review group and mentioned some of the areas where planning had links to public health.
- 3.23 He talked about Planning’s involvement in the provision and protection of public open space; Section 106 Planning Obligations¹¹, where the Council negotiates contributions from developers towards the provision of public open space needs of residents. Planning is also closely involved in road safety and sustainable transport and is consulted when impact statements and travel plans are submitted in relation to developments, which are matters he felt Planning could be more focused on.
- 3.24 There is a wide range of areas where planning’s work overlaps with that of public health. Paul Butcher, the Council’s Director of Public Health added that he had recently attended a regional meeting with some local authority development planners. There are currently some “cultural differences” that needed to be addressed, for example reference was made to Planners tending to focus their main thoughts and considerations on the potential legal implications of an application, with currently less input into the public health aspects.
- 3.25 Further discussion focused on issues such as the locations of fast food outlets and planning law, particularly in relation to schools; air quality in relation to planning policies; the development of the Calderdale Local Plan, with particular regard to public health input into the Plan’s development.
- 3.26 The Council’s Principal Tourism Officer and Cycling Officer also provided both updates and responses to matters previously raised by the review group on cycling development in Calderdale, including on a draft outline cycling strategy

¹¹ We subsequently learnt that from 6th April, 2015 we can no longer collect Section 106 monies from developers to improve schools or infrastructure until we have a Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL) in place. Work has been started on this but not yet finalised.

for Calderdale; infrastructure development and bid for Cycle City Ambition Grant 2¹²; promotion of cycling routes and tourism; bike libraries and work with schools, particularly with developments at Ravenscliffe High School and Sports College.

- 3.27 In addition to the attendance of Councillors and Officers at this evidence gathering session, the Review Group also received and considered written submissions from Phil Ratcliffe, the Council's Development Strategy Manager in relation to the local and regional context to housing and house building figures.
- 3.28 Councillor Smith-Moorhouse, in relation to housing / house building figures also brought to the review group's attention some census information as contained in the consultation on draft budget proposals report 2015/16 – 2017/18 (Equality Impact Assessment) submitted to cabinet in February, 2015 ¹³
- 3.29 Data collected by the census was used to provide statistical outputs which Calderdale Council, along with other surveys, then used to identify and meet the needs of its local communities. In particular, there was evidence for the need for more housing provision and tackling Empty Properties in the Borough, with according to the 2011 Census, the population of Calderdale being 203,800, a 5.9% increase from the 2001 Census figure (an increase of about 11,400 people).
- 3.30 Trends identified included the overall number of pensioners (65+) in the district has risen by 8% to 32,400 compared with the number aged 65+ in 2001, and the working age population (15 to 64) has also increased by 8%, to 133,900. However, the number of children and young people (0 to 14) has fallen by 2.5%, to 37,500.
- 3.31 There had been a 9.5% increase in the number of households in the district where at least one person in the household had a long term problem or disability, although it was noted that only 4.8 in every 1,000 new GP registrations in Calderdale were made by people who previously lived abroad (as compared with an average 8.3 per 1,000 across Yorkshire and the Humber)
- 3.32 According to some recent research¹⁴, the migrant population of England has risen by 565,000 since 2011, with two-thirds coming from the European Union, analysis by the University of Oxford estimates – see link to BBC article published 6th March, 2015:- <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-31748422> The

¹² On the 3rd March, 2015, the West Yorkshire Combined Authority (WYCA) welcomed an announcement by the Department for Transport (DfT) that its applications for £22.1m for Leeds City Region (LCR) cycling schemes had been successful. The amount will also be matched through local funding sources taking the total allocation to £30 million in the next three years for City Connect 2.

¹³ Report of the Director of Communities and Service to Cabinet 9th February, 2015 – Consultation on draft budget proposals 2015/16 – 2017/18 (Appendix 1 – Budget Equality Impact Assessment)

¹⁴ BBC website news report published 6th March, 2015 - <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-31748422>

figures suggest that the foreign-born population of every local authority in the country may have risen, and consequently the need for more housing / pressures for more house building.

- 3.33 Councillor Smith-Moorhouse further mentioned that as she understood the situation, Central Government was not providing extra funding to cope with population increases. It was falling on local authorities to provide for these population increases, and during times of austerity this was bound to have knock-on consequences, which will require prudent management and smart budgeting by the Council to meet demand and needs.
- 3.34 Five year housing supply – housing requirement figures and up to date Local Plans should be used for calculating a five year supply. There is a requirement to do this set out in the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) and the accompanying Planning Practice Guidance (PPG)
- 3.35 There are currently no up to date Local Plan figures in Calderdale.
- 3.36 The Town and Country Planning Act 1990, Section 215 Best Practice Guidance 2005, provides a local planning authority with the power, in certain circumstances, to take steps requiring land to be cleaned up when its condition adversely affects the amenity of the area. Officers' are working on several sites in Calderdale at the moment in this regard.

Recommendation 9

That Cabinet be informed that it should request a policy paper as soon as possible on how the £1.4m affordable warmth scheme recently agreed by Council providing grants to improve heating and insulation was to be implemented and it is recommended that that the Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel could be used as “sounding board” on this important piece of policy development work. Links to public health, hospital trust and Adults Health and Social Care, the Better Care Fund and the work of the Health and Well-Being Board would also needed to be considered in taking this work forward.

Appendix 1

WHAT EXTRA WE CAN DO? – OUR RECOMMENDATIONS

<p>Recommendation 1</p>	<p>That the Director of Communities and Service and the Director of Public Health, are requested to prepare a leaflet containing details, lengths etc. mapping National Cycle Route 66, perhaps dividing it into manageable lengths, and showing access points, so that local people and tourists are made aware of what Calderdale was offering in its endeavour to support cycling. This would be a good way forward to support healthy living, outdoor pursuits, and safe cycling and it is essential that the information is passed to the public via Tourist Information Centres, libraries and websites, etc.</p>
<p>Recommendation 2</p>	<p>That to help promote active and sustainable travel across the Borough, Cabinet be asked to consider setting aside a portion of the annual highways budget specifically for cycle path improvements.</p>
<p>Recommendation 3</p>	<p>That Cabinet be asked to give consideration to the establishment of one or two data analyst positions to work on a cross- council basis <i>(economic justification for establishment of posts – invest to save basis)</i></p> <p><i>(Whilst appreciating the Council already has an in-house Business Change and Performance Team, the review group felt that a dedicated data analyst resource would be beneficial to the Council in the long run in addressing fuel poverty / affordable warmth in particular and that Cabinet should consider this as a proposal on an “invest to save” basis. Further discussions around the principles of “open data”, sharing with partners and other organisations should also be explored and undertaken).</i></p>
<p>Recommendation 4</p>	<p>That the Portfolio Holder / Cabinet and the Director, Economy and Environment be requested to take note of and consider the evidential research previously undertaken by the National Institute of Environmental Health and the Building Research Establishment</p>

	(BRE) which suggests that targeting the Borough's worst housing with a £1.4m investment programme could save an estimated £4.65m in associated health care costs (and the increase in economic benefits such work would bring to the Borough).
Recommendation 5	That Cabinet's agreement and support be sought for the early revision of the Calderdale Air Quality Action Plan (AQAP), which was written in 2009 and is in need of updating.
Recommendation 6	That Cabinet's agreement and support be sought to the undertaking and promotion of a targeted campaign of awareness of the on-going West Yorkshire Low Emissions Strategy (WYLES) work from a public health perspective, with the primary delivery method to be through low cost platforms such as social media (Facebook, Twitter etc.)
Recommendation 7	That Cabinet is asked to endorse and support more direct enforcement work being undertaken by external partners of the Council, such as the police, through the use of legally enforceable powers to tackle un-roadworthy vehicles with high emissions.
Recommendation 8	That Cabinet is asked to look into the possibility of undertaking a feasibility study into the possibility of introducing designated Low Emission Zones (LEZs) in Calderdale.
Recommendation 9	That Cabinet be informed that it should request a policy paper as soon as possible on how the £1.4m affordable warmth scheme recently agreed by Council providing grants to improve heating and insulation was to be implemented and it is recommended that that the Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel could be used as "sounding board" on this important piece of policy development work. Links to public health, hospital trust and Adults Health and Social Care, the Better Care Fund and the work of the Health and Well-Being Board would also needed to be considered in taking this work forward.

Appendix 2

Membership of the Detailed Scrutiny Review

Councillor J Baker (Chair)
Councillor M James
Councillor R Marshall, MBE
Councillor S Press
Councillor J Smith-Moorhouse

Membership of the Economy and Environment Scrutiny Panel (2014/15)

Councillor J Baker (Chair)
Councillor R Holden
Councillor J Lynn
Councillor A Martin
Councillor C Pillai
Councillor S Press
Councillor A Tagg

(Support to this Scrutiny Review Group was provided by Paul Preston, Scrutiny Support Officer, Democratic and Partnership Services)

Summary of Persons Giving Evidence

Councillor Peter Caffrey, Cabinet Member for Economy

Councillor Janet Battye, Chair, Calderdale Health and Well-Being Board

Councillor Ali Miles, Member Champion, Public Health

Paul Butcher, Director of Public Health, Calderdale Council

Helen Rhodes, Sustainable Housing and Environment Manager, Economy and Environment Directorate

Richard Armitage, Housing Projects Manager, Economy and Environment Directorate

Derek Shackleton, Principal Officer (Enforcement), Housing, Environment and Renewal, Economy and Environment Directorate

Jez Tweed, Environmental Management team, Economy and Environment Directorate

Anne Holdsworth, Environmental Projects Officer, Economy and Environment Directorate

Peter Stubbs, Transportation Officer, Economy and Environment Directorate

Ryan Carroll, Senior Environmental Health Officer, Housing, Environment and Renewal, Economy and Environment Directorate

Sally Jones, West Yorkshire Low Emissions Strategy (WYLES) manager.

Richard Seaman, Development Manager, Economy and Environment Directorate

Phil Ratcliffe, Development Strategy Manager, Economy and Environment Directorate (written submission)

Katie Kinsella, Principal Tourism Officer, Communities and Service Directorate (written submission)

Andy Geall, Cycling Officer, Calderdale Council

Appendix 4

References and Bibliography

Notes of all meetings of the local environment and public health detailed scrutiny review - held by the Scrutiny Support Team, Room 10, Halifax Town Hall

Research document – the role of the local authority in health issues – Sunderland City Council – Public health, wellness and culture scrutiny panel report 2012-13

Background / discussion document provided by Director of Public Health - developing policies that promote active and sustainable travel across the borough – December, 2014

Background / discussion document provided by Director of Public Health - Affordable warmth and Public Health - December, 2014

Background / discussion document provided by Director of Public Health - Developing policies that seek to mitigate the public health effects of environmental pollution - December, 2014

Written submission (focus on active travel evidence gathering session) – cycling development in Calderdale – report of the Cycling Officer – December, 2014

Written submission (focus on active travel evidence gathering session) – update on canal towpaths for active travel – report of the Environmental Projects Officer / Transportation Officer – December, 2014

Oral submission (focus on active travel evidence gathering session) – feedback from a Cycling conference hosted by Calderdale Council building on the TDF legacy

Written submission (focus on cold homes / affordable warmth evidence gathering session) – Calderdale Joint Strategic Needs Assessment - statistical data, including information on excess winter deaths reported

Written submission (focus on cold homes / affordable warmth evidence gathering session) – Cold Homes and Public health – report of the Housing Projects Manager, Economy and Environment Directorate – December, 2014

Written submission (focus on cold homes / affordable warmth evidence gathering session) – document by the Building Research Establishment (bre) (part of the BRE trust), entitled “the health costs of poor housing (and the benefits to the NHS of improving it)” – January, 2015

Written submission (key stakeholder evidence gathering session) – information on housing / house building provided by the Council’s Development Strategy Manager, Economy and Environment Directorate

Calderdale Council News Centre – press release promoting the review group’s work – focus on a healthy environment for a healthy Calderdale

Written submission (key stakeholder evidence gathering session) – cycling / tourism – report of the Principal Tourism Officer / Cycling Officer – February, 2015

Powerpoint presentation – Sally Jones, West Yorkshire Low Emissions Strategy (WYLES) manager

Public Health England report – first published 9th April, 2014 – Research/Analysis: estimating local mortality burdens associated with particulate air pollution. <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/estimating-local-mortality-burdens-associated-with-particulate-air-pollution>

Report of the Director of Communities and Service to Cabinet 9th February, 2015 – Consultation on draft budget proposals 2015/16 – 2017/18 (Appendix 1 – Budget Equality Impact Assessment)

Local Government Information Unit (LGiU) Daily News - Friday, 20th February 2015 – article entitled “Housing”

Public Sector Executive (PSE) e-newsletter article – 8th December, 2014 – entitled “Air Pollution now a public health crisis”

Glossary of Terms Used in the Report

AQAP – Air Quality Action Plan

AQMA – Air Quality Management Area

AQO - Air Quality Objectives

BRE - Building Research Establishment

CAWP – Calderdale Affordable Warmth Partnership

CCG – Clinical Commissioning Group

CIL – Community Infrastructure Levy

CNA – Calderdale Needs Assessment

DEFRA – Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs

DPH – Director of Public Health

EHO – Environmental Health Officer

EPC – Energy Performance Certificate

EWD – Excess Winter Deaths

EU – European Union

HHSRS – Housing, Health and Safety Rating System

JSNA – Joint Services Needs Assessment

JWS – Joint Well-Being Strategy

LCR – Leeds City Region

LED – Light Emitting Diode

LEZ – Low Emission Zones

NCN – National Cycle Network

NPPF – National Planning Policy Framework

PPG - Planning Practice Guidance

TdF – Tour de France

UK – United Kingdom

WHO – World Health Organisation

WYCA – West Yorkshire Combined Authority

WYLES – West Yorkshire Low Emissions Strategy

Any enquiries or requests for background information,
please contact Paul Preston, Democratic and Partnership
Services, Calderdale Council, Halifax Town Hall, Halifax,
HX1 1UJ

Tel: (01422) 393250

Email: scrutiny@calderdale.gov.uk
<http://www.calderdale.gov.uk>